A stimulating effect of peacekeepers and aid workers on sex trafficking?

A market approach

University of Groningen
Network on Humanitarian Action (NOHA) Master Thesis
October 2010

Supervisor and corrector: Dr. A.J. Zwitter
Student: Verena Elders (s1350013)
Mathenesserdijk 114A
3027 AK Rotterdam
The Netherlands
E verena_elders@hotmail.com
T +31(0)650521195
Contents

Acronyms and abbreviations 2

Introduction 4

1. Sex trafficking, conflict and international presence: the concepts 9
   1.1 Sex trafficking as a subcategory of trafficking in persons 9
   1.1.1 Trafficking in persons 9
   1.1.2 Sex trafficking 11
   1.2 Armed conflict and international presence 12
      1.2.1 Armed conflict and post-conflict situations 12
      1.2.2 Peacekeeping: military and civilian missions 14
      1.2.3 Aid agencies 15
   1.3 Market forces: supply and demand 16

2. A market approach to sex trafficking: the relevance of demand 18
   2.1 Supply and demand of sex trafficking 18
   2.2 The cause of trafficking: preponderance of demand 20
      2.2.1 A note on the relevance of migration theory 20
      2.2.2 Research into causes of trafficking 22
      2.2.3 The predominance of demand 25
   2.3 The demand for sex trafficking: consumers, victims and ‘services’ 25
      2.3.1 The consumers 25
      2.3.2 Victims and services 28
   2.4 Breaking down demand 29
      2.4.1 Desirability 29
      2.4.2 Acceptability and justifiability 30
      2.4.3 Accessibility 33
   Conclusion 35

3. Sex trafficking towards conflict zones 36
   3.1 International presence and sex trafficking: occurrence 36
      3.1.1 Peacekeeping forces 36
      3.1.2 Aid workers 38
      3.1.3 Other reports of sexual misconduct and abuse 40
      3.1.4 Accounting for differences in reports of sexual misconduct and abuse 42
   3.2 Applicability of the theory 43
      3.2.1 Desirability 43
      3.2.2 Acceptability and justifiability 44
      3.2.3 Accessibility 52
   Conclusion 53

Conclusion 55

Bibliography 58
Acronyms and abbreviations

AU | African Union
CDT | Conduct and Discipline Team (DPKO)
CDU | Conduct and Discipline Unit (DPKO)
CEDAW | Convention on the Elimination of all Forms of Discrimination Against Women
CEE | Central and South Eastern Europe
CIS | Commonwealth of Independent States
CSDP | Common Security and Defence Policy (EU)
CSW | Commission on the Status of Women
DFS | Department of Field Support (DPKO)
DPKO | Department of Peacekeeping Operations (UN)
DRC | Democratic Republic of the Congo
EU | European Union
HIV/AIDS | Human Immunodeficiency Syndrome / Acquired Immunodeficiency Syndrome
IASC | Inter-Agency Standing Committee
ICRC | International Committee of the Red Cross
ICTY | International Criminal Tribunal for the former Yugoslavia
IHL | International Humanitarian Law
ILO | International Labour Organization
IO | International Organization
IOM | International Organization for Migration
ISAF | International Security Assistance Force (NATO)
KFOR | Kosovo Force (NATO)
MINUSTAH | United Nations Stabilization Mission in Haiti
MONUC | United Nations Mission in the Democratic Republic of Congo
NATO | North Atlantic Treaty Organization
NGO | Non-governmental organization
OHCHR | Office of the High Commissioner for Human Rights (UN)
OIOS | Office of Internal Oversight Services (UN)
OSCE | Organization for Security and Co-operation in Europe
PKO | Peacekeeping operation
SRSG | Special Representative to the Secretary General (UN)
UN | United Nations
UNAMET | United Nations Mission in East Timor
UNDP | United Nations Development Programme
UNHCR | United Nations High Commissioner for Refugees
UNIAP | United Nations Inter-Agency Project on Human Trafficking
UNICEF | United Nations Children’s Fund
UNMEE | United Nations Mission in Ethiopia and Eritrea
UNMIK | United Nations Interim Administration in Kosovo
UNMIL | United Nations Mission in Liberia
UNMISS | United Nations Mission in Sudan
UNMIT | United Nations Integrated Mission in Timor-Leste
UNOCI | United Nations Operation in Côte d’Ivoire
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Acronym</th>
<th>Description</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>UNODC</td>
<td>United Nations Office on Drugs and Crime</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>UNMIBH</td>
<td>United Nations Mission in Bosnia Herzegovina</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>UNTAC</td>
<td>United Nations Transitional Authority in Cambodia</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>UNTAET</td>
<td>United Nations Transitional Administration in East Timor</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>UNTSO</td>
<td>United Nations Truce Supervision Organization</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>WFP</td>
<td>World Food Programme</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Introduction

“[T]rafficking can be viewed as an illicit market. It is the interaction between supply and demand. In the receiving countries there is, and always will be a demand for cheap labour and sex. In countries of origin there is always a dream of a better life and the ability to support oneself and family members back home” (Aronowitz, 2001: 172).

Trafficking in persons (“trafficking”) is the modern manifestation of the age old phenomenon of slavery. It is a highly profitable, multi-faceted crime prohibited by international law in which many actors are involved, including traffickers, victims and facilitators of all sorts (Aronowitz, 2001: 172). Its contemporary victims are the socially and economically vulnerable who are forced into dishonourable labour and who remain trapped through threat, mental abuse, physical violence, and indebtment. Although it is possibly exceeded in scale by other forms of the human trade, trafficking in women for sexual exploitation (“sex trafficking”) is the manifestation which has attracted most attention, as it is possibly most abominable. Victims of sex trafficking are not treated as employees; their bodies are considered inputs in a highly lucrative business, sold on from one exploiter to the next, and forced to prostitute their body and integrity to whomever desires it.

In criminology and migration studies, conflict zones have been studied extensively as areas of origin of trafficking, as armed conflict and its consequences create physical, economic and social insecurity which push persons to flee and which make persons vulnerable to being deceived, coerced and exploited by those seeking to exploit their vulnerability. Although conflict zones are an important origin of illicit migration, to a lesser extent, they have also caused a reverse pattern of illicit migration, making them destinations of sex trafficking flows. Ironically, the occurrence of this pattern is increasingly being linked to the presence of those seeking to bring peace, stability, aid and development: international peacekeepers and other international personnel.

The correlative relationship between peacekeeping and sex trafficking has become painfully visible in conflict zones such as Kosovo, Bosnia and Herzegovina, and the Democratic Republic of Congo (DRC), where peacekeepers have supported the development of sex trafficking markets by demanding prostitution, which creates incentives for
trafficking. There are clear indications that these are not isolated incidents; in fact, a causal relationship between peacekeeping and sex trafficking is increasingly being acknowledged (United Nations Secretary General, 2002).

Interestingly, despite the international denunciation of sex trafficking through the acknowledgement that it may amount to slavery (UNODC, 2000), the stimulating effect of peacekeepers on sex trafficking seems to be considered a logical, or at least an expected consequence of their presence. This was expressed most painfully by the “boys will be boys” attitude of the United Nations Special Representative to the Secretary General (SRSG) to Cambodia in response to allegations (Whitworth, 2004: 71). The SRSG to Bosnia and Herzegovina, Elizabeth Rehn, in 1999 stated: “As head of a peace-keeping mission which is 97 per cent male (…) I cannot be so naïve to think that my staff are not visiting brothels which hold women in slavery” (Rees, 1999: 2).

To take Rehn’s anticipatory approach further: We cannot be so naïve to expect that other international workers, such as aid workers, refrain from using the services of trafficked women. Although reports have not appeared to the extent that they have related to peacekeepers, indeed, several reports seem to justify an anticipatory stance (Wölte, 2004; Csáky, 2008). The scope of the problem may be graver than thus far estimated, as organizations are reluctant to report on the involvement of their workers for reasons of reputation, and as incidents may be underreported by victims for various valid reasons (Csáky, 2008: 9).

This study seeks to create an explanatory framework for the phenomenon of sex towards conflict zones. Trafficking as a field of study has attracted researchers from various academic fields, including gender studies, human rights, criminology and humanitarian assistance, allowing for a variety of vantage points which may contribute to a holistic understanding of the multidimensional phenomenon. In order to create greater understanding of the dynamics behind the obscured phenomenon, researchers have attempted to identify its causes. Thus far, the majority of studies into causes have remained focused on the push and pull mechanism of migration theory, as a result of which an all-encompassing understanding of the phenomenon is still lacking. However, a groundbreaking market approach to trafficking research has been introduced by Bales (1999), Kelly and Regan (2000), Anderson and O’Connell Davidson (2002), and Hughes (2004) which breaks down the phenomenon to the interaction between suppliers and consumers within a particular environment. Although
such an approach may seem banal, it is justified and necessitated by the fact that the human trade is one of the most profitable illicit businesses in the world. Moreover: it is able to identify the driving force behind the phenomenon: consumer demand.

Therefore, this study seeks to answer the question: To what extent are market forces created as a result of international presence in conflict zones, facilitating sex trafficking towards (post) conflict zones? It can be considered an extension of the work of Bales, Kelly and Regan, Anderson and O’Connell Davidson, and Hughes related causation of general trafficking and sex trafficking. It however seeks to go beyond the depth of studies conducted thus far by focusing on demand and its determining factors, answering to a need which has been identified by several authors (Masud Ali, 2005: 154; Raymond, 2004: 1160; Commission on the Status of Women, 2005). The limited number of studies on demand have not provided “adequate information regarding the factors influencing demand” which have led the customer side of trafficking to remain under-theorized (Masud Ali, 2005: 154).

The study into the creation of trafficking markets in response to peacekeepers’ and aid workers’ demand for prostitution is not only necessitated by the need for the development of multi-dimensional academic research approaches to the phenomenon of trafficking; moreover, the very consequences of trafficking on host societies and effectiveness of organizations’ and agencies’ peacekeeping and aid missions make it ever more stringent.

The effects of demand-induced trafficking on post-conflict societies are considerable and harmful. Instead of creating a basis for peace, justice and development, missions may leave behind an environment of gender inequality, human rights abuse, health risks, crime and corruption. Sex trafficking markets do not cease to exist after termination of missions; the women exploited remain in local prostitution, or may be relocated or re-sold in search of greater profits. At a more profound level, the stimulation of illicit prostitution markets creates, perpetuates and institutionalizes post-conflict gender inequality. The possibilities for corruption identified during international presence are likely to be continued to be utilized to evade and undermine the rule of law in the post-mission era.

Apart from impacting on host societies, it may seriously harm the credibility and legitimacy of organizations’ missions. For example, revelations about involvement of United Nations (UN) peacekeeping personnel in sexual exploitation in the DRC “have done great harm to the name of peacekeeping.” (United Nations General Assembly, 2005). As a result of
diminished credibility and legitimacy, beneficiary communities’ recalcitrance may be created and public support for current and future missions may diminish. The public support for peacekeeping organizations and aid agencies in donor communities may diminish, reducing moral and financial support for much-needed missions.

By contributing to the analysis of demand as a causal factor of trafficking, this study contributes to the identification of entry points for interventions addressing consumer demand. In host countries of peacekeeping and aid missions, this may prevent the tolerance, promotion and institutionalization of gender inequality and the promotion of crime and corruption (Morris, 2010: 192) and allow for the development of societies based on equality and justice. In host and donor countries, this may preserve and increase support for such aid and peacekeeping missions.

In terms of geographical scope, this study focuses on conflict and post-conflict areas where the international community is represented through peacekeepers and/or aid workers. More specifically, these areas are studied as areas of destination for sex trafficking rather than as areas of origin, which is more common in migration and trafficking research. In terms of temporal scope, it relates to missions conducted since World War II. Although aid missions existed prior to this (for example the International Committee of the Red Cross), World War II and the founding of the UN in 1945 were succeeded by a strong increase of development, humanitarian and peacekeeping missions. The first peacekeeping operation, conducted under UN command, commenced in 1948.

This desk study draws heavily from academic literature and non-academic research from a variety of disciplines, including criminology, human rights, humanitarian assistance, economics and gender studies. As a starting point, it draws from academic literature related to determinants of trafficking in persons in combination with general market theory. The trafficking research used is conducted from the perspectives of human rights, criminological and gender studies. From this literature, factors determining trafficking are distilled, which are supported by reports on the issue from non-governmental organizations and individual researchers. The explanatory framework is applied to the phenomenon of sex trafficking in (post-) conflict situations in the last chapter, which is strongly based on research reports from non-governmental organizations (NGOs) and other information from NGOs and international organizations, as well as academic literature related to trafficking and peacekeeping. Even
though evidence of aid workers and peacekeepers as consumers of is limited as a result of non-disclosure and limited reporting by victims, some academic literature, research reports and news reports pointing to its occurrence have emerged.

As stated above, in order to create an explanatory framework for peacekeeping and aid-induced sex trafficking, a demand-focused market approach to the phenomenon is applied in this study. In the succeeding chapter, a conceptual foundation is laid down, which is necessitated by the potential ambiguity of the terms used (Chapter 1). As research employing a market approach to the phenomenon has thus far remained limited, in Chapter 2 the approach is introduced, framing it within the broader realm of research into causes of trafficking. The market approach is elaborated and developed further by the dissection of consumer demand into three essential elements (desirability, acceptability/justifiability, and accessibility). In Chapter 3 an overview of the available evidence of peacekeepers and aid workers as consumers of the sexual services of trafficked women is presented, which can be framed within the broader phenomenon of sexual exploitation and abuse by peacekeepers and aid workers. The occurrence is analyzed using the three elements of demand presented in the preceding chapter. The conclusion and discussion provide demand-related entry points for further research, which could aid to identify strategies for prevention which go beyond the only partly effective abolitionist strategy towards prostitution and which could aid “those responsible for controlling the demands of that market” in ensuring that they are controlled” (Rees, 1999: 3).
1. Sex trafficking, conflict and international presence: the concepts.

This chapter provides the conceptual framework which this study is founded on, which the very subject matter of this study necessitates. As the definitions of many of the concepts used in this study lack universal acceptance, each of them requires clear defining. Even though an international definition of the term ‘trafficking in persons’ was elaborated by the United Nations, it is not applied universally. The specific form of sex trafficking lacks an internationally accepted definition and is regularly confused with trafficking in general. Sex trafficking should however be framed within the broader phenomenon of trafficking in persons.

In this study, sex trafficking is connected to armed conflict. Below, the meaning of conflict is elaborated, in order to make clear what situations this study related to. While armed conflicts may cause an outflow of fleeing civilians, they regularly cause an influx of several types of actors and organizations into the area, which are referred to in this study as ‘international presence’. This includes peacekeeping missions, and aid agencies, both of which require defining.

1.1 Sex trafficking as a subcategory of trafficking in persons

1.1.1 Trafficking in persons
As indicated in the introduction of this study, sex trafficking is one of the manifestations of the broader phenomenon of trafficking in persons. Trafficking in persons has been internationally defined as “the recruitment, transportation, transfer, harbouring or receipt of persons, by means of the threat or use of force or other forms of coercion, of abduction, of fraud, of deception, of the abuse of power or of a position of vulnerability or of the giving or receiving of payments or benefits to achieve the consent of a person having control over another person, for the purpose of exploitation.” (United Nations, 2000: art. 3). The precise manifestations of the latter purpose can be manifold, but include “sexual exploitation, forced labour or services, slavery or practices similar to slavery, servitude or the removal of organs” (Ibidem). It is important to note, although this possibility is regularly neglected, that
trafficking does not require the crossing of international borders; ‘internal trafficking’ is equally possible.\footnote{Internal trafficking is regularly referred to as ‘pimping’ in literature and common use.}

Whether something can be qualified as trafficking in persons is thus dependent on “what occurs at the end of a process of transporting a person from one place to another” (Bales, 1999). Other than in the case of human smuggling – a form of illicit migration often confused with trafficking in persons – persons who are trafficked are kept in a situation of prolonged exploitation; persons who are smuggled are released upon arrival in a destination country (Gallagher, 2002: 25-28).\footnote{Although the differences may seem straightforward, the distinction between the two types of migration may not be easy to make. For example, human/migrant smuggling may turn into human trafficking when it develops from service provision (the facilitation of illegal migration) into exploitation. This may be intended by the trafficker from the start (the smuggling being a cover-up), or a change of intention and victimization may occur during the process. As smuggled migrants have no guarantee that their facilitators are not traffickers, they are particularly at risk of being trafficked. For a deeper analysis of the distinction between the two terms and relevant UN Protocols, consult Anne Gallagher. ‘Trafficking, smuggling and human rights: tricks and treaties’, Forced Migration Review 12 (2002), 25-28.} Victims of trafficking end up in slavery or in a slavery-like situation, escape from which is rendered virtually impossible through mental and physical control, physical abuse or debt bondage.

All countries are affected by trafficking, albeit in different manners and to different extents. Within trafficking research, the countries victims originate from are denoted as ‘countries of origin’. In general, countries of origin are developing countries or countries in transition. Recruitment takes place in these countries, after which victims are transported through “transit countries”, to end up in a “destination country”, which is generally a country of relative prosperity (Aronowitz, 2001: 170). As a result, countries have been categorized as countries of origin, transit or destination on the basis of the predominance of either. Although this may be practical, “most countries sit either side of the origin/destination divide” (Kelly & Regan, 2000: 5). In the case of internal trafficking, a country is all at the same time. The categorization of countries is subject to change, as general trafficking patterns are related to relative poverty and relative prosperity and as traffickers have tactically started a system of rotation of victims over several countries in order to diminish risks of detection (Aronowitz, 2001: 166). Organized criminal groups, which are structured groups which commit serious crimes with a goal to survive and make profit (United Nations General Assembly, 2000; Albanese, 1995: 56), are widely known to be deeply involved in the profitable and relatively
low-risk (Kelly & Regan, 2005: 5) business of trafficking. Nevertheless, individuals or small groups may equally force a woman into exploitation when an “opportunity” presents itself (Rees, 1999: 2).

The scale of the phenomenon of trafficking is impossible to measure as a result of definitional variation in crime statistics and the self-evident invisibility of the crime. Besides that, trafficking is not just a single offence; it often entails a series of criminal offences (such as abduction, sexual abuse, document forgery, the illegal crossing of international borders, and fraud) which are categorized in different categories of crimes (such as crimes against property, crimes of violence, etc.). “In practice, while it is relatively simple to count how many homicides occur during a certain period, counting cases involving trafficking in persons, for example, requires either a legislative provision that criminalizes such trafficking or the splitting of the concept into the different crimes that are committed in the course of the more complex trafficking action” (Alvazzi del Frate, 2006: 4). A focus on individual offences may distract attention from the broader phenomenon. These three factors cause estimates of its proportions to not reach any measure of accuracy beyond the level of ‘guesstimates’, which is why no attempt is made to estimate the size of the phenomenon in this study.

1.1.2 Sex trafficking
This study does not focus on the entire phenomenon of trafficking, but is limited to a particular category of trafficking victims (female victims) for a specific form of exploitation (sexual exploitation). Trafficking for the purpose sexual exploitation will be referred to as ‘sex trafficking’ and will in this study solely refer to the trafficking of women and girls. It should be noted that this is not to deny the existence of sexual exploitation of men and boys (Rees, 1999: 2), but merely a consequence of scope, lack of information and lack of indications that sex trafficking of men and boys is a widespread problem in conflict zones.

---

3 In many countries, charges for the criminal offence of trafficking in persons are relatively low in comparison to other types of illicit trade (such as arms trade and drug trade).

4 As a result of its undisclosed nature, the size of the problem of trafficking in persons (including sex trafficking) has proven difficult to estimate. Several international organizations, states, and researchers have estimated the size of the phenomenon. However, the range of estimates is extremely wide (ranging from several thousands to about 1,000,000 trafficking victims worldwide), without adequate accounts of the methods of calculation and with varying definitions of the phenomenon. This study therefore does not attempt to estimate the scale of the problem.
Like prostitution, it is difficult to categorize sex trafficking as either sex or labour (Anderson & O’Connell Davidson, 2004: 36). Even though specific reference is made to sexual exploitation in the international definition of trafficking, it has been argued that it is a variant of forced labour. Various agents, for a variety of reasons, consider sex trafficking identical to trafficking in persons or trafficking in women, a specific form of trafficking, or an exemplary form of the phenomenon. Sex trafficking is a subcategory of trafficking in persons, though the terms are often mistakenly believed to equate. For the purpose of this study sex trafficking is considered a specific form of trafficking for exploitation of labour and sexuality, which is characterized by the serious violation of victim’s personal and physical integrity through the forced execution of sexual acts. The yields of the exploitation accrue to those who control the women.

General characteristics of the supply and demand of sex trafficking will be provided in Chapter 2. This study does however not provide detailed descriptions of the victimization process, the trafficking process and victim’s experiences, the variety of which is multitudinous. Women who are sexually exploited may have experienced varying degrees of coercion in the recruitment process: from full-fledged abduction to deception (for example through false labour perspectives as a nanny, a waitress or a dancer). Women may even know that they will work in prostitution, though may not have expected to work in forced prostitution and not receive their earnings. They may have been smuggled across international borders, or they may have migrated in a lawful manner, after which they entered into forced labour. They may be unable to quit because of debts incurred in the smuggling process, the withholding of salaries, confiscation of their passports by their exploiter, or through (the threat of) force, forced drug use or fear of criminal prosecution.

1.2 Armed conflict and international presence

1.2.1 Armed conflict and post-conflict situations

As there is no internationally accepted legal definition of armed conflict, the term is a matter of politics. Originally, armed conflicts were resorted to only by states, and were preceded by

---

a declaration of war by either party to the conflict. Currently, such ‘interstate’ or ‘international armed conflicts’ are the only type of armed conflicts which is referred to as ‘war’ - and traditional wars become relatively extinct in recent decades. Over the last century, the nature of armed conflicts has changed; they have become less clear in terms of antagonists and scope. To be precise, particularly since the end of the Cold War the incidence of less clear-cut armed conflicts has risen through the emergence of internal or intra-state conflicts, such as civil wars and wars of separation. Such conflicts are also referred to as ‘non-international armed conflicts’, though they can become internationalized when another state intervenes directly or lets participants in the conflict act on its behalf. The traditional entities which were entitled to wage war, states, need not even be a party to such a conflict. Non-state entities include rebel and guerrilla forces and paramilitary groups.

There is no temporal or geographical limitation to the definition of ‘armed conflict’, as the Appeals Chamber of the International Criminal Tribunal (ICTY) for the Former Yugoslavia has decided (2000, para. 84):

“an armed conflict exists whenever there is resort to armed force between States or protracted armed violence between governmental authorities and organized armed groups or between such groups within a State.”

Like the above ruling, this study is based more on the factual existence of armed violence rather than the traditional laws of war (ius ad bellum) and more adequately responds to the realities of contemporary armed conflicts. Although the terms ‘protracted’ and ‘armed violence’ in the ICTY definition bring about the problem of minimum thresholds, in this study international presence, notably in the form of United Nations-mandated missions, may be a strong indication that this requirement is met.

The term ‘conflict zone’ or ‘conflict area’ used in this study refers to geographical areas where armed conflicts take place. However, information in this study is not limited to the cessation of armed force, which may not be relevant for international presence (defined below). In terms of international presence the cessation of hostilities and transfer to a post-

---

6 Appeals Chamber of the International Criminal Tribunal for the Former Yugoslavia, Tadić case, Judgment of 15 July 1999, para. 84.
7 Appeals Chamber of the International Criminal Tribunal for the Former Yugoslavia, Tadić case, Judgment of 15 July 1999, p. 488
conflict phase generally does not lead to an immediate withdrawal; often their presence is extended beyond the conflict phase, possibly by the altering of mandates. However, for reasons of legibility, the term ‘conflict zone’ is sometimes used instead of ‘post conflict zone’. The conflict zones referred to in this study include all past and current conflict zones with international presence.

1.2.2 Peacekeeping: military and civilian missions

Peacekeeping operations (PKOs) can be distinguished into two types: military and civilian missions, though missions are often a combination of both. Military missions consist of lightly armed soldiers who serve as a buffer between contending forces, as observers of the situation or as supervisors of ceasefires (Barash & Wehel, 2002: 358; Department of Peacekeeping Operations, 2008: 21). Often they are supported by civilian police as well as civilian personnel. While military missions are aimed at maintaining peace and security, civilian missions are aimed at strengthening the state through the development of political and judicial processes, disarmament and reintegration of former combatants and the return of refugees and internally displaced persons.

The phenomenon of peacekeeping was developed by the United Nations (UN) in light of the Cold War, during which forces were mainly deployed to proxy wars. With the end of the Cold War this changed to deployment mainly to civil wars and intra-state wars. Three principles are crucial for the deployment of peacekeeping forces: consent of the main parties to the conflict, impartiality and non-use of force except in self-defence and defence of the mandate” (Department of Peacekeeping Operations, 2008: 31). Peacekeepers are thus not mandated to fight unless out of self-defence. Among all peacekeeping forces, those authorized by the UN Security Council are most well-known and are often referred to as ‘blue beret’ soldiers. UN peacekeepers act under UN command, but are made up of the armies of UN member states as the organization does not have its own military forces.

Numerous peacekeeping missions have been sent to conflict zones in the past, the first of which was the United Nations Truce Supervision Organization (UNTSO) which has functioned as an observatory and supervisory mission in the Israel-Palestine conflict since 1948. Of all 64 UN peacekeeping operations which have been conducted, 16 are currently
ongoing. Other organizations are North Atlantic Treaty Organization (NATO), the Organization for Security and Cooperation in Europe (OSCE), the European Union (EU) and the African Union (AU). NATO peacekeeping forces have operated in the Former Yugoslavia and Afghanistan. The European Union is mandated to send peacekeeping missions under its Common Security and Defence Policy (CSDP), and African Union missions can be authorized by their Peace and Security Council.

1.2.3 Aid agencies
Apart from missions aimed at facilitating political solutions and the diminishing of violence, other agencies may also move into crisis areas to support the civilian population. One can distinguish between aid agencies with humanitarian mandates (short-term relief activities) and developmental mandates (longer-term developmental activities), although some organizations may combine mandates.

Humanitarian agencies provide immediate aid and relief to civilian populations affected by human and nature induced humanitarian crises, which include armed conflicts and natural disasters. Historically, humanitarian agencies have operated and delivered assistance according to need, on the basis of their founding principles of humanity (a belief in the human dignity of all), independence (from governments and politics), impartiality (non-discrimination), voluntarism (voluntary service), – and often neutrality (not taking sides in a conflict). The current variety of organizations which has been brought about as a result of the blurring of mandates and the non-compliance to all original humanitarian principles, has ignited debates about what constitutes a humanitarian agency (Hilhorst, 2002: 196). This defies the possibility of attaining a detailed, consensual definition. The current study does not go into that debate, but qualifies agencies which qualify themselves as humanitarian agencies and which relieve human suffering through the delivery of assistance on the basis of need.

9 EUFOR (acronym for ‘European Union Forces’) police, justice and monitoring missions have been deployed to Bosnia and Herzegovina, Central African Republic, Chad, DR Congo, Georgia, Indonesia, Macedonia, Palestine, Sudan and Ukraine-Moldova. A judicial EUFOR mission was deployed to Iraq. These missions include missions under UN command.
and humanity in the fields of shelter, health, water and sanitation, nutrition, education, and agriculture as humanitarian organizations (Inter-Agency Standing Committee, 2008).

Apart from humanitarian agencies, development agencies may also operate in conflict situations. Other than humanitarian assistance, which is relatively short-term compared to development aid and aimed at alleviating immediate suffering, development organizations aim to provide long-term improvement through durable improvement of economic and social structures. Development aid is related to activities including poverty alleviation, livelihood development, micro credit initiatives, education, and healthcare.

In this study, both humanitarian agencies and development agencies are referred to as ‘aid agencies’. Organizational structure and membership may vary: organizations can be non-governmental (NGOs) or international organizations (IOs, such as United Nations High Commissioner for Refugees [UNHCR]); funded by donations from the public or by governments, or a combination of both. Locally, aid agencies are often supported by (local and international) civilian personnel.

1.3 Market forces: supply and demand

Markets are the meeting place of sellers and buyers of goods and services, who both gain by the trade. This applies to tangible products as well as service products, to licit as well as illicit markets. In essence, the functioning of markets depends on the interaction between demand and supply. ‘Demand’ can be defined as “the desire to possess something with the ability to purchase it”; to demand something is “to claim [it] as just or due” (Raymond, 2004: 1158-1159). ‘Supply’ is “the act or process of filling a want or need” (Merriam Webster, http://www.merriam-webster.com/dictionary/supply?show=1&t=1286455297); supplying something is to “make (something wanted) available to someone” (Oxford Dictionary, http://oxforddictionaries.com/definition/supply?rskey=c4f7tl&result=2#m_en_gb0831670).

Consumers bring about a demand for goods and services, to which suppliers respond by supplying the goods and services asked. The price mechanism is essential for the

---


11 The notion that trade may benefit both parties to a transaction is part of classical economic theory. It contrasts the mercantilist belief that mutual gain is impossible.
quantities that suppliers are willing to supply and the quantities consumers are willing to extract. At a high price, suppliers’ preference for profit maximization causes them to be willing to sell many products. However, consumers withhold consumption if they deem prices too high; they maximize consumption if prices are low. These adversary effects lead to an equilibrium, where an equilibrium quantity is supplied and consumed at an equilibrium price.

Trade does not take place in a vacuum of demand and supply; both demand and supply change in response to each other, under the influence of external factors, and in response to factors affecting either. Demand and supply are thus not ‘givens’; they operate and fluctuate under influence of factors which include interaction with the other market force, as well as exogenous factors. Equilibrium prices continuously fluctuate in response to these shifts (Dunn & Mutti, 2004).

The price that is paid for the good or the service in question can be influenced by changes in demand and supply, which in turn are affected by a multitude of factors. If prices fall, an “income effect” brought about by the amount that is saved as a result of the price fall may cause a tendency for consumers to consume more, depending on the elasticity of consumers’ demand. The availability of alternatives which serve as potential substitutes could cause a “substitution effect”, diminishing demand for the product. Apart from changes in supply, demand is also affected by a multitude of other variables, including personal preferences and marketing. Likewise, supply may be affected by the emergence of more profitable markets in alternative products or the prohibition of a product.

Illicit markets (of which the sex trafficking market is one) entail either the trade in prohibited products and services, or the trade in legal products and services in a prohibited manner. Illicit (or ‘informal’ or ‘black’) trades are essentially run for financial profit (Hughes, 2005: 12). In the specific market of trafficking in persons, six different types of business models have been identified, which makes obvious the wide variety of trafficking processes (Shelley, 2003: 119-131). As any illicit activity brings about a risk of detection and subsequent penalization, the gain that is attained through the activity must outweigh the (perceived) risk.

12 These are the “Natural Resource Model”, the “Trade and Development Model”, the “Supermarket Model”, the “Violent Entrepreneur Model”, the “Traditional Slavery and Modern Technology Model” and the “Rational Actor Model”.

17
Chapter 2. A market approach to sex trafficking: the relevance of demand

In order to be able to explain and theorize how conflict areas can turn into destinations of sex trafficking with the entry of peacekeepers and aid workers, first a more general assessment of the phenomenon of sex trafficking is necessary. This chapter analyzes the relevance of market forces of supply and demand in driving the trade. Many authors and organizations have pointed to push and pull factors of migration as the main causes of trafficking, a view which is challenged in the current chapter. It is argued that push and pull factors are to a large extent part of the supply side of trafficking rather than the demand side, and that, despite the preponderant focus on the former, in fact the latter determines trafficking more strongly. This study attempts to further investigate the element of demand for further research by identifying its preconditions. As such, it builds on the modest available literature on demand-related research.

This chapter starts with the application of supply and demand to the specific case of sex trafficking and the meaning of the terms in a sex trafficking context. It is succeeded by the identification of the relevance of the market factors of supply and demand in determining the trade in women for sexual exploitation. This leads to a conclusion on the predominance of demand, which necessitates subsequent analysis of demand by distillation of its determinant factors.

2.1 Supply and demand of sex trafficking

The introduction into market factors presented in the previous chapter necessitates further exemplification of these terms in relation to sex trafficking, in order to be able to move beyond abstraction and to comprehend what (and whom) these market factors embody. The supply side of trafficking refers to the victims: the women who are deceived or forced into a situation of mental, physical or financial control and who have to place their bodies at the disposal of traffickers and customers. The victimization processes used to recruit women are
multitudinous, and the degrees to which women are coerced, threatened, abused and indebted vary.\textsuperscript{13}

Victims are supplied, transported and forced into exploitative businesses by persons and organizations involved in the trafficking process. Often, though not always, several persons are involved in the trafficking process, performing different tasks in the recruitment, transportation and exploitation stages. As a consequence, the person who recruits the victim is generally not the person who exploits the victim in a prostitution market in the destination stage (the “final exploiter”). Rather, the victim is sold on by persons who recruit, transport and exploit human beings, creating a chain of re-sale. Furthermore, final exploiters often sell on their women to other final exploiters, making the term “destination stage” more blurry.

The involvement of organized criminal groups, networks and enterprises in trafficking is considerable, as the market yields long-term profits at a relatively low risk (Albanese, 1995: 62-63). Although exploitation by final exploiters as well as the type of trafficking business run by organized crime networks clearly amount to the crime of trafficking in persons (and hence can be referred to as ‘traffickers’), persons operating in the preceding stages may not necessarily be identified as traffickers, particularly when a situation of human smuggling evolves into trafficking. Avoiding entering into the debate about whom may be classified as ‘traffickers’, this study refers to those intentionally providing the supply of women for sex trafficking as ‘suppliers.’

In the context of sex trafficking, demand can be analyzed in a broad and a narrow sense. Anderson and O’Connell Davidson (2003: 9) employ a broad approach to demand which includes both individual customers (also referred to as ‘consumers’, ‘clients’, of ‘clientele’; those buying the sexual services of trafficked women) and third parties: the exploiters (also referred to as ‘traffickers’ or, too favourably, ‘employers’). Apart from customers and exploiters (the “primary” and “secondary” factors of demand), Hughes (2005: 7) adopts a definition which also includes the destination countries and the culture which promotes or tolerates exploitation as the two other factors or levels of demand. As this study examines the effect of the presence of particular categories of persons (jointly referred to as ‘international presence’) as customers, demand is considered to be represented by those persons as ultimate consumers, as “[w]ithout them making the decision to buy sex acts,

\textsuperscript{13}This study does not include an account of victimization and recruitment strategies in trafficking, which are not as straightforward as they may seem. For a concise description, consult Aronowitz, 2001: 166-167.
prostitution would not exist” (Hughes, 2004: 2). In this study ‘demand’ is thus defined narrowly, only to represent individual customers, who (as stated in the previous chapter) have a “desire to possess” which they claim as “just or due” (Raymond, 2004: 1158-1159). Further specification of the consumers is given below (Section 2.3.1. The consumers).

2.2 The cause of trafficking: the preponderance of demand

2.2.1 A note on the relevance of migration theory
People do not just leave behind their livelihoods, homes, families and relatives to move elsewhere. They have expectations about the improvement of the quality of one or more elements in their life in the destination area in comparison to their area of origin. That expected improvement is significant to such an extent that it stimulates them to migrate. Even though the set of motivations is unique in each individual case of migration, at an aggregate level they can be modelled as a ‘push-pull mechanism’, consisting of negative factors which ‘push’ persons to move away from their original place of residence in conjunction with positive factors which ‘pull’ persons towards a destination area.

The root causes for migration lay in “the social, economic and political conditions” of countries of origin (Gunatilleke, 1994: 65). The ‘push’ factors which propel persons to leave their original residence area relate to economic and physical insecurity, the manifestations of which include (relative) poverty, high population growth, hunger, lack of employment and education opportunities, disease, violence, armed conflict, oppressive regimes and human rights violations. Economic crisis in Eastern Europe has propelled westward migration. Armed conflict and its consequences have pushed Afghan and Iraqi civilians into internal displacement, into neighbouring countries and further. Food insecurity, as well as political turmoil, poverty and violence, has been a significant motivation for out-migration for Ethiopian civilians.

People are drawn to specific destinations on the basis of characteristics of those destinations which their original habitats display to an unsatisfactory extent. In general, these characteristics are the opposite of the push factors: better livelihoods through economic and physical security. Expectations of employment, economic prosperity, development, education opportunities, and physical security, freedom and better health are among the reasons which
may determine selection of a particular area as a destination. Whether these perceptions and expectations are realistic is an entirely different matter.

General patterns of migration clearly reflect push and pull theory: migration originates in areas of relative poverty and/or physical insecurity and is destined for relatively prosperous areas and/or areas with relative physical security. This means that there are flows from the global South (developing countries) to the North (industrialized countries), though not all migration covers such a long geographical distance; this is where the issue of relativity comes in. Much international migration takes place within geographical regions, as a result of different measures of economic and physical security intra-regionally.

The push factors of migration have been identified by multiple authors and organizations as the causes of trafficking (Aronowitz, 2001: 184-185). However, although ‘push’ and ‘pull’ factors are determining elements of trafficking flows, it should be noted that in the case of human trafficking the operation of this mechanism may be limited. This is a natural consequence of the characteristics of trafficking itself. From the perspective of the person wanting to migrate, the same motivations to move elsewhere, in the form of factors pushing them from their area of origin and pulling them towards a particular destination, still drive their personal preference for a trafficking route. However, when opportunities to migrate in a legitimate manner are limited or inaccessible to people, they are forced to resort to illicit means of migration, thus using the services of human smugglers (or human traffickers “disguised” as human smugglers).

Illicit migration through the use of human smuggling makes persons vulnerable to being exploited. When illicit ways of migration are resorted to, migrants lose control of the migration process, as they virtually entrust the smuggler with their fate and have no guarantee that they will be free to walk away when they arrive at the destination. In other words: persons who let themselves be smuggled cannot be sure whether their smuggler is not a trafficker. They cannot be certain whether they are entering into an economic transaction of service provision or into a process of enslavement.

As traffickers (as well as smugglers) have control over both the illicit migration process and the persons they are trafficking, they instead of the person being migrated have control over the selection of a destination country. The original preference of the trafficked person then loses strength as a determinant of trafficking destinations; traffickers allocate their inputs at the locations where they expect them to be most profitable. Victim’s
testimonies bear witness to the fact that they have been deceived and transported to a different destination than they agreed to be migrated to. The original ‘pull’ factors are thus rendered irrelevant through the trafficking process and are replaced by factors which pull traffickers to allocate their victims to a specific destination where they are expected to yield most profits. In other words: when a person is coerced and loses their free will to decide “their perception and pursuit of opportunity becomes moot” (Bales, 1999: 12).

2.2.2 Research into causes of trafficking

As a result of its complexity, trafficking can be studied from a multitude of scientific perspectives, as has increasingly been done over the last decades. However, trafficking research has thus far concentrated predominantly on the symptoms and the various appearances of the phenomenon. Nevertheless, the necessity to move beyond scattered quantitative research has become apparent in recent years, and calls for synchronization of data collection have been expressed.\(^{14}\) This trend has been accompanied by deeper research into the underlying causes of trafficking which was initiated around the turn of the century.

Several researchers have identified a wide variety of factors as causes of trafficking, including “increased and widespread poverty, insufficient educational and training opportunities, high demand for cheap labour and sex, and ignorance of the risks and dangers involved” as well as a lack of legislation, lack of political will, corruption, lack of capacity, lack of co-operation as the causes of trafficking (Aronowitz, 2001: 184-185). Additionally, Bales (1999) in an exploratory investigation of global trafficking attempted to distinguish determinant statistical factors which may predict trafficking towards countries. He did so by distilling 76 variables, five of which displayed significant correlation in determining destinations: the percentage of male population over 60 years of age; government corruption (as an indicator of permeability of borders); infant mortality, food production, and per capita energy consumption (the latter three as indicators of the economic well-being of the destination) (Bales, 1999: 13).

Kelly and Regan determined that in the context of trafficking into Europe, historical ties between countries seem to have a stimulating effect on trafficking routes and destinations (2003: 23). This is for example shown by the intensity of trafficking from former colonies towards or through former colonizing countries. This may be explained by the greater knowledge of the market and useful border/immigration weaknesses as a result of historical acquaintance. The existence of a large immigrant population seems to correlate to the occurrence of trafficking, as do tolerance and existence of a large sex industry (Aronowitz, 2001: 166-167). Many within the anti-prostitution lobby claim that legalization of prostitution causes trafficking. Nevertheless, prohibition of criminalization does not preclude it from going underground.

Although these attempts to identify correlative characteristics between supply and destination countries may be useful, their predictive value is far from conclusive. In fact, most factors mentioned as supposed causes are in fact factors which contribute to the supply of victims or factors which facilitate. As Hughes and Roche indicate, ‘push’ factors contributing to supply of victims are wrongly identified as explanations for trafficking. However, those factors would not be so powerful had there not been demand from the sex industry and customers (1999: 1). The supply and facilitating factors allow the trade to be sustained. As stated above, supply of trafficked victims seems to be unlimited as a result of push factors which will continue to feed a desire to migrate among relatively disadvantaged persons, as well as the existence of traffickers who seek to exploit the vulnerability of those persons. As in any market, it is not the supply of products that sustains trade, but the demand for it. In 2001, Anderson and O’Connell Davidson initiated pioneering exploratory research into the relevance of the demand-side of trafficking in persons by analyzing the demand for trafficking for commercial sexual exploitation and domestic labour, laying the basis for further qualitative and empirical demand-related research. Through multi-country pilot studies, both employer demand and customer demand for trafficking were studied (Anderson & O’Connell Davidson, 2003).  

15 The multi-country pilot study concerning employer demand and consumer demand was conducted in Denmark, Italy, India, Thailand and Japan.
2.2.3 The predominance of demand

Aronowitz in a study of the markets and organizations behind the phenomena of human trafficking and human smuggling states that “trafficking in migrants could not have grown to such proportions if it were not supported by powerful market forces” (Aronowitz, 2001: 171). As indicated above, the potential attainment of considerable profit at comparatively low risk compared to other forms of trafficking provides a strong incentive for profit-seeking entrepreneurs. Ever more restrictive immigration policies in destination countries diminish opportunities for licit migration while the demand for migrant labour in those countries persists (ibidem; Escaler, 1998: 16).

As simplistic and seemingly redundant as it may be: sex traffic is not profitable without demand, as “it would be highly unprofitable for pimps, recruiters, and traffickers to seek out a supply of women” if demand would be non-existent (Raymond, 2004: 1160). Even though no large capital investment is required for trafficking in persons, supplying a good or service that is not demanded would be still be unprofitable. To date, the supply side of trafficking has been researched more extensively than the demand side. The notion that in fact the latter might be most influential has only started to emerge fairly recently. Several researchers have concluded that it is not the supply, but in fact the demand for the sexual services of trafficked women is the predominant propeller behind the market for trafficking (Bales, 1999; Anderson & O’Connell Davidson, 2003).

Possibly, as Anderson and O’Connell Davidson credibly suggest, consumer demand in the specific segment of sex trafficking more directly determines the composition of the victim population than other forms of trafficking. For example, in the market for tangible products which are being produced by forced labourers, the consumer “has no interest in the identity of the workers whose labour produced them, the worker’s age, gender, race, nationality, caste, and/or ethnicity, as well as her/his appearance, demeanour and linguistic capacities” (Anderson & O’Connell, 2003: 10-11). In the sex trafficking market however, the identity of the victim is of great importance (see below, 2.4.2 What does demand constitute?).

Despite the predominance of demand for prostitution over supply, the supply side is far from irrelevant: the excess of supply over demand allows the phenomenon to persist. An unlimited pool of potential victims who are seeking better opportunities elsewhere keeps the supply side of trafficking stocked up. However, the existence of supply does not
automatically induce consumption; consumption requires acceptability and justification in social contexts (Ibidem: 41). Furthermore, it has been suggested that supply and trafficking route act as a stimulus for demand in certain contexts (Kelly, 2002). As indicated above, pull factors influencing supply are not fully able to account for destinations of trafficking (Bales, 1999: 7).

If demand created by consumers is the most immediate cause of sex trafficking, it calls for an in-depth study of demand and how it drives trafficking. Despite the fact that the term ‘demand’ is used in research related to both sex trafficking and general (non-forced) prostitution, analysis rarely goes beyond “an abstract emphasis on market forces” (Raymond, 2004: 1160). The precise characteristics of the demand seem to be neglected or to be considered obvious, ‘natural’ givens. Furthermore, the handful of studies concerning demand dynamics fail to devote due attention to the factors influencing demand (Masud Ali, 2005: 15).

2.3 The demand for sex trafficking: consumers, victims and ‘services’

2.3.1 The consumers
If demand from consumers is to be addressed, it should be delineated, because, as Raymond states: “(…) in much discussion of demand, men once more become invisible when demand is articulated in terms of the market and economic push/pull factors” (2004: 1160). This is remarkable, as sex trafficking is a highly gendered phenomenon of which the supply side has been studied as a gender issue extensively. The demand side, which can be said to be equally gendered, albeit related to the opposite sex, has not yet received such attention. Demand for prostitution comes overwhelmingly from men (Anderson & O’Connell Davidson, 2004: 37), to such an extent that “a prostitution market without male consumers would go broke” (Raymond, 2004: 1160). Therefore the consumer population of trafficking is analyzed in this section. First of all, the masculinity of the population making up the source of the demand should thus be acknowledged. However, the gender of the demand sheds little light on the categories or types of male customers – if customers can be categorized in the first place.

Who, then, are those men who buy the services of forced prostitutes? Do they all seek to buy services from trafficked women intentionally? The answer is no. As sex trafficking may be part of a broader sex industry in which “free choice” and trafficked prostitutes work
side by side, costumers may not always be able to distinguish whether prostitutes perform their work out of free choice or because they are being forced. As a consequence, the consumers of the services of trafficked women may partly be identified by examining consumers of commercial sex in general. This is not so allege that all men who use commercial prostitution represent the demand for trafficked prostitutes; it is simply to point out that demand for any given commercial sexual service can just as well be met by someone working independently in good conditions as by someone subject to abusive and slavery-like practices (Anderson & O’Connell Davidson, 2003: 11).

Research into the consumers of prostitution suffers from the limitation that it has not been conducted on a global scale, but predominantly in developed countries (Anderson & O’Connell Davidson, 2004: 37). As a result, results cannot be generalized to include developing countries. With respect to developed countries some observations and conclusions have been made. In general, it can be concluded that men who use the services of prostitutes come from all age groups, ethnicities, and nationalities (Raymond, 2004: 1160). Although it may be assumed that consumers of commercial sex use it as a substitute and a lack of a sexual partner or a non-satisfactory sex life, research tends to falsify this assumption. In fact, surveys and interviews with consumers reveal that the majority have a steady partner or are married; many have children or are planning to have them in the future. Furthermore, the majority have sexually satisfying relationships (Hughes, 2005: 14).

Attempts to identify and categorize a group of American customers on the basis of their attitudes and motivations for prostitute-use by Sawyer et al. has led to a categorization of consumers into four groups: the “negative compulsive type” (Men who say they do not enjoy sex with prostitutes, but go anyway), the “positive compulsive type” (Men who say that they enjoy sex with a prostitute, but have attempted to stop going), the “positive accepting type” (Men who say they enjoy sex with prostitutes, do not try to stop, support legalization of prostitution) and the “socially inadequate type” (Men who exhibit characteristics of shyness, social discomfort, and introversion) (Sawyer et al., 2001-2002: 363-376). This reveals different motivations for commercial sex, as well as varying attitudes towards their own behaviour.

Research into customer motivations for purchase of commercial sex has revealed a multiplicity of reasons. Commercial sex is consumed for “entertainment, sexual gratification, and acts of violence” (Hughes, 2005: 7). Some surveys suggest that customers seek
companionship and (non-sexual) intimacy (Plumridge et al., 1997; Jordan, 1997; Graaf et al. 1992). More commonly noted motivations given by prostitution-users include “the desire for a particular kind of sexual experience, the desire for particular kinds of sexual partners [and] the control over when and how to have sex (Anderson & O’Connell Davidson, 2004: 37). Apart from the psychological or emotional aspects to the desires, it has been widely acknowledged that the physical desire to have sex is a biological drive present in human beings.

Although customers come from all layers and segments of society, particular occupational groups have been suggested to be more prone to using prostitute than others, including truckers, police, military and seafarers. Additionally, men who spend time abroad, whether for leisure or for business, are more likely to use prostitution (Anderson & O’Connell Davidson, 2004: 37). Among occupational groups that are relatively prone to buying sex, the price of sex seems to be an important consideration for their decision to consume. In fact, they are more likely to increase their use of prostitution if prices are lower. Lower prices thus increase their demand (Bellis et al., 1996; Anderson & O’Connell Davidson, 2004: 38-39). This is where market economics and the price effect come in again: if prices are low (relative to neighbouring countries or relative to the amount consumers are willing to pay), the price effect experienced by these consumers causes them to increase their consumption to some extent. Oversupply and consequential competition over customers in local prostitution markets, as well as general price levels and low transportation costs may cause prices for commercial sex to be low.

However, examining the general consumer population of commercial sex does not suffice, as it may be manifest to customers that the sex transaction they engage in could be or is one with a trafficking victim. Moreover, the victimhood of the prostitute may be a source of sexual appeal. Anderson and O’Connell Davidson in their interview research with customers uncovered a seeming link between customers’ attitudes towards prostitutes and their likelihood to knowingly engage in sex transactions with trafficked women: Men who regard the commercial sex market as a commodity market in which women are the commodities, seem to be more likely to use the services of trafficked women than men who perceive the commercial sex market as a market of professional service provision (Anderson & O’Connell Davidson, 2003: 23-25). This seems to suggest that customers’ perception of prostitutes as commodities or objects renders the consent of women irrelevant. Additionally,
the former group seems to be more likely to justify and tolerate violence against prostitutes than the latter (Anderson & O’Connell Davidson, 2004: 9; Monto, 1999). Furthermore, there is some indication that consumers who consider prostitutes dirty, yet necessary for male sexual relief or a quick fix for sexual relief are more likely to have a preference for under-aged prostitutes than those who consider prostitutes skilled workers (Anderson & O’Connell Davidson, 2003: 20). Research on the psychology of customers suggests that a considerable share of them may suffer from psychopathologies and held false beliefs about prostitution which helped them justify their behaviour (Sawyer et al., 2001-2002). The use of false beliefs for the attainment of personal and social justification of behaviour is further discussed below (2.4.1 Acceptability and justifiability).

2.3.2 Victims and services
Apart from identifying who represent it, demand must also be analyzed in a different sense: what does it constitute? In other words, whom is being asked to perform what sexual activities? Women working in sex industries may engage in sexual entertainment (such as telephone sex, striptease, lap dancing, go-go dancing, peep shows, and sex shows), prostitution and pornography (Raymond, 2004: 1159. In the case of sex trafficking sexual entertainment and prostitution are most desired. Particular forms of commercial sexual activities (so-called “domination services”, such as pornography for the dominatrix market and telephone sex) seem to be rarely associated with sex trafficking (Anderson & O’Connell Davidson, 2004: 58).

Other than women who have entered prostitution out of free will and who have control over the choice of clients, the number of clients as well as the activities they perform, trafficked women have little if any say in whom they service, how often, and the sexual activities that they are asked to carry out. As a consequence, victims of sex trafficking run a greater risk of being demanded to have unprotected sexual intercourse with their clients and run a greater health risk than free prostitutes. Forced prostitutes are also more prone to physical violence than free prostitutes.

Users of prostitution do not only have specific wishes in terms of sexual activities; they also have preference for a specific type of woman delivering fulfilling those services. In commercial sex, consumers rarely buy the so-called “disembodied” labour or services from any prostitute; they often buy “embodied” labour and services, performed by a woman from
a certain age group, nationality, ethnicity, caste or class (Anderson & O’Connell Davidson, 2002: 33). The trafficking market can be dissected into “niche markets” which make clear that specific types of victims (virgins, under-aged girls, certain ethnicities, women with language skills) are recruited and allocated for specific markets (Hughes, 2005: 21 and 24). Furthermore, prostitution is a highly racialized (Anderson & O’Connell Davidson, 2002: 34).

Research suggests that men’s preference for embodied prostitution services can be divided into two categories: “sameness” versus “otherness.” Customers often seek “sameness” in terms of ethnicity and/or nationality, though “otherness” may specifically be sought after too, as a manifestation of perceived exoticness or inferiority, both of which may be sexually attractive to consumers (Anderson & O’Connell Davidson, 2004: 40). The price hierarchy, when perceived from the perspective of ethnicity, and framed in terms of “sameness” and “otherness”, seems to support this (Ibid.). Self-evidently, what is perceived as “same” and “other” naturally depends on local or regional contexts as well as the identity of the consumer and is thus highly subjective. Customer preferences and the prices they are willing to pay for specific women determines provides suppliers with marketing opportunities and determines the targeting of specific types of women in specific origin countries, as well as their allocation. After all, suppliers allocate their goods to the markets where they yield most profits.

2.4 Breaking down demand

As stated above (1.3 Market forces: supply and demand), demand can be described as “The desire to possess something with the ability to purchase it”, which is by the person demanding it claimed to be “just or due” (Raymond, 2004: 1158-1159). While these definitions grasp some of the elements which are the very essence of demand (desire, ability to purchase, and justness), the elements in the definition require elaboration. The elements of “desire” and “justness” play an important role here, as well as the “ability to purchase”. In this section, a first attempt to identify the factors influencing demand is made.

2.4.1 Desirability

Demand is based on desire. This study is based on the notion that the sexual desire is a biological drive which is present in human beings in general. If such a drive were absent, it is
hypothesized, demand for prostitution (and hence sex trafficking) would be far less or nearly non-existent (although non-sexual motivations behind demand mentioned above would remain). As indicated above, the commercial sex market is one that consists mainly of female sex workers, servicing a demand which originates almost exclusively from male consumers.

Unlike the goods market, in a sex trafficking context, being a context of sexual service provision, the possibility for customers to possess a tangible product is virtually impossible. The desired product to be possessed should thus be understood to relate to the purchase of a service. Even though a biological desire for sexual behaviour is general to human beings, it is by no means self-evident to seek for its fulfilment through the use of commercial sex, as is argued in the following section.

2.4.2 Acceptability and justifiability

Although desire originates from a biological characteristic of man, the decision to consume commercial sex to fulfil that desire is a matter of choice, which is made on the basis of the weighing out of considerations against each other (Hughes, 2005: 9). Despite a wide variety of motivations for the desire to consume commercial sex (above), the resort to prostitution is by no means self-evident or unproblematic. Demand for trafficked women for sexual exploitation is not something which simply exists and the availability of women whose sexual services can be bought does not cause consumption of those services per se. The demand is a social construct: the consumption of sexual services from a stranger must be considered socially justified and acceptable according to socially agreed standards (Anderson and O’Connell Davidson, 2003: 41). In other words: persons “have to be taught to feel that consuming such services is a sign that they are “having fun”, a marker of their social identity and status as “real men”, “adult”, “not-gay”, or whatever” and that their behaviour is justified on the basis that it is socially considered “normal, natural, necessary and/or inevitable.” What is considered justified, depends to a large extent on the behaviour of peers and “what they get away with” (Ibidem, 42).

What is considered acceptable or justified can be highly fluid and subjective. In their exploratory research Anderson and O’Connell Davidson showed that consumers apply manipulative thinking processes in order to justify their behaviour. For example, consumers

---

16 Teenage boys who are taken to prostitutes by their friends for their first sexual experience might be an exception to this because of the high level of group pressure involved (Hughes, 2005: 9).
with a preference for under-aged girls (aged 18 and less) we shown to apply constructed ideas that the girls were in fact women who were capable of consent, whom were physically mature and would not be harmed by the experience. By applying such thinking methods, one adjusts his mental picture of his behaviour in order to make it comply with standards of social acceptability. Furthermore, as also was shown in the study, customers’ verbally expressed disapproval of sex trafficking is not necessarily met with actions supporting that attitude (2003: 19-20).

In social contexts, norms governing social behaviour to a large extent remain unwritten. However, a share of norms is codified into written laws and regulations, such as constitutions and criminal codes, which can be applied for the governing of social behaviour in a particular social environment. The scope of the environments can range from local to universal, governing all within that that scope, or a defined population. Sex trafficking is regulated and prohibited by universal laws (most importantly the United Nations Trafficking Protocol), regional and national laws, but also by functional codes of conduct and regulations for specific branches of labour. Most importantly, criminalization of prostitution may prevent persons from engaging in it, which means that the person will be engaging in a criminal activity if he pursues his desire. Although prostitution has been legalized in some countries, complete or partial circumscription of prostitution exists in many others. Several initiatives to discourage demand for prostitution have been undertaken as a means to combat sex trafficking. It can entail the prohibition of pimping (penalizing those exploiting women), of prostituting (criminalizing prostitutes) or of the consumption of commercial sex (criminalizing customers\textsuperscript{17}). For example, in Sweden demand was addressed through the criminalization of the consumption of commercial sex services, on the basis of the assumption that the risk brought about by criminalization diminishes demand from customers, disrupting or, ideally, destroying opportunities for profit for traffickers (Hughes, 2005: 32).

In social contexts in which sex trafficking is prohibited by law, resorting to illicit forms of prostitution may entail a risk of penalization; a risk which at a maximum could

\textsuperscript{17} For example in Sweden a proposal for the criminalization of customers was done on the basis of the assumption that without male demand, exploitation of women would be considerably less. In: Raymond, 2004: 1157-1158.
trigger a sentence of life imprisonment or capital punishment.\textsuperscript{18} Also where such legal prohibition is lacking, social unacceptability may create a social risk, such as social exclusion, shaming, stigmatization, or other forms of reprimand. However, the effectiveness of written and unwritten social norms regarding the acceptability of the buying of sex (as well as the sale of it) is only effective if accompanied by strict enforcement. If inadequately enforced, prostitution and trafficking will only be forced to move even more underground. It could even push prices of sex up as it becomes scarcer, presenting opportunities for greater profits for traffickers who manage to exploit new circumstances. Initiatives to combat trafficking through the closure of establishments have been introduced as well, though the effectiveness of such initiatives can be questioned, as traffickers are creative and flexible in responding to closure through relocation of their business. What is clear from these examples, is that as long as there is access to commercial sex, criminalization does not pose a risk which keeps customers from buying sex unless there is a risk of detection and penalization, as a consequence of enforcement of laws. If not accompanied by effective enforcement, legislation remains symbolic. It is thus dependent on the enforcement of those norms and consequences in case of non-compliance. What is essential is that social and legal risks serve as a discouragement only if the severity of punishment and the risk of detection are sufficiently high.

When the above is inverted and considered in light of destination areas of trafficking, it can be hypothesized that in destination areas of sex trafficking, the phenomenon is inadequately discouraged. The cause of this could be its relative acceptability and/or inadequate enforcement. Although stricter enforcement could be one side of the equation, the other half is the change of attitudes underlying the norms governing social behaviour, lessening acceptability of behaviour. To that end, sensitization and awareness raising initiatives have been initiated to battle ignorance – and effect behavioural change.

As people apply manipulative thinking methods, the increase of knowledge about trafficking of women for sexual exploitation does not necessarily prevent it. What is more, forced sexual exploitation may even be a source of attraction. The fact that mere knowledge alone is not sufficient was clear in research conducted by Anderson and O’Connell Davidson (2003: 25). In the research, customers displayed diverging attitudes despite knowledge of sex

\textsuperscript{18} Example of states where prostitution is punishable with life sentence/death penalty.
trafficking: some, particularly those holding the view that prostitution is a commodity market, seemed to consider the lack of free will a consequence of the prostitution market, and hence a natural characteristic women in that market should accept; and some even seemed to find women submission and exploitation sexually attractive. However, the opposite was also recorded (sexual unattractiveness of exploited women), as well as disapproval of trafficking on moral grounds. Nevertheless, immorality was shown to be subordinate to considerations of availability of alternatives, affordability and drunkenness (Ibidem: 25-26). Knowledge and disapproval of trafficking can thus not be considered a strict guarantee against the use of services of trafficked women. However, social (including penal) risks may serve at effecting changes in behaviour where moral conviction of unacceptability does not adequately curb behaviour.

2.4.3 Accessibility
The third element of demand for sex trafficking relates to the ‘ability to purchase’, which can be interpreted as physical and non-physical (financial) access to sex trafficking. For trade to be possible the opportunity for suppliers and customers to interact is required; customers must be able to actually purchase and consume the service. In sex trafficking, the purchase requires the victim and customer to be able to meet. The transaction can be done by direct payment to the supplier (the person controlling the victim, such as a pimp), or through the victim, who hands it over to the person who controls her.

No matter how strong demand for a product may be, if suppliers’ products cannot reach consumers, no trade will take place. This basic fact highlights the requirement of market access and physical meeting places. Market access for sex trafficking - the possibility to migrate trafficked women into a country to be employed in the illicit sex industry there - varies per country. For cross-border trafficking first and foremost the possibility to move women across borders is required. This migration can be conducted in a completely legal manner (using women’s authentic passports and conforming to immigration procedures), after which she is put in a situation of exploitation. Immigration requires a certain measure of openness of state borders, both in a physical (border crossing-points) and non-physical manner (immigration, labour, health regulations). Knowledge of weaknesses in border or migration control may also be exploited. The ease of crossing borders (for example in the Schengen area, where physical border controls have been lifted) increases opportunities for
clandestine immigration (Aronowitz, 2001: 169-170; Kelly & Regan, 2000: 23). Trafficking into a country depends on what Bales refers to as the “permeability” of its borders (Bales, 1999: 11). Even though permeability is immeasurable “we might think of the index of governmental corruption as one indicator (…), since corruption often plays a part in the opening of borders to traffickers.” For lack of a more accurate indicator, permeability of border is thus indicated by corruption indices (Ibidem).

Apart from access to a market in terms of physical immigration into a country, a platform or location for transactions to take place is essential. Once inside the territory, the corruption of government officials and civil servants enable the evasion or adulteration of immigration, labour, health, tax and other regulations and facilitate the placement of women in the local sex market (marketing). In the sex industry, that physical platform is provided by bars, restaurants, hotels, (in)formal brothels, as well as the streets. Countries with formal sex industries (such as The Netherlands) or a tolerance for an extensive informal sex market dispose of such platforms and seem to be able to absorb trafficked women with relative ease (Kelly & Regan, 2000: 23). Apart from in establishments, transactions can also take place virtually anywhere (in homes, cars, outside). What seems to be essential is privacy and (in cases where prostitution is illegal or otherwise socially unacceptable) likelihood of non-detection.

The inventiveness of traffickers in responding to changes in enforcement, combined with the existence of some level of corruption in every state, cause borders to be rarely impermeable, if ever. Additionally, the considerable profits that can be raised, combined with the relatively mild punishment in comparison to other forms of trafficking means that there is a strong incentive for traffickers (and those who profit from its toleration) to ensure continuation of business.

Apart from physically accessible, illicit prostitution must also be financially accessible to customers. Though simplistic, affordability is a very relevant requirement for the realization of desires. The male population demanding commercial sex services need to dispose of the means to buy them, most generally in the form of disposable income. Alternatively, payment in kind is possible, which could include the granting of certain favours (possibly amounting to corruption). The necessity of affordability of commercial sex services is supported by the general pattern of trafficking flows, which are destined at countries of relative wealth (UNODC, 2006: 20). As indicated above, price hierarchies are
common; customers’ possibility to get the embodied services they desire thus depends on affordability.

**Conclusion**

Contrary to common belief, the push and pull mechanism governing general migration patterns cannot be assumed to be the core causes of trafficking in women for sexual exploitation, as trafficking is driven more by consumer demand than victim’s wish to migrate. The submission of the victim to the trafficker through the transfer or the seizure control to the latter renders the will of the victim about any aspect of their life irrelevant; the exploiter’s will determines the business and location the victim will be allocated to, and the circumstances she will work in. Based on suppliers’ objective to raise profit, victims are recruited and allocated in response to demand, wherever they are expected to yield most profit.

Demand can be considered to mean “a desire and ability to possess (consume) something which is considered just or due.” Considered in the light of economic theory, demand is not just an abstract desire; it entails the fulfilment of that desire. In sex trafficking, demand originates from a diverse male population which has a biological desire to have sex and which considers it socially acceptable and justifiable to consume commercial sex, possibly knowingly from women who are being sexually exploited. The population’s motivations and attitudes to prostitution and trafficking may vary greatly. The social unacceptability of prostitution and/or sex trafficking, if backed by a real chance of enforcement and serious consequences, may pose a risk which prevents persons experiencing a biological desire from fulfilling it. Apart from acceptability, consumers also have sufficient access to prostitution/trafficking markets. When border controls or enforcement thereof are lacking, it is fairly effortless to transport women across borders. When border controls and other laws are enforced, corruptible officials facilitate illicit immigration and illicit prostitution. The three elements making up the requirements for sex trafficking consumption are thus: desirability, acceptability and accessibility.
Chapter 3. Sex trafficking towards conflict zones

The previous chapter argued the importance of demand for the creation and stimulation of trade in women for sexual exploitation. It introduced the notion that the demand for sex trafficking by male populations depends on three elements: desirability, acceptability (justifiability) and accessibility. In the current chapter, the applicability of these elements to the specific case of conflict zones with international presence is assessed, in order to be able to construct an explanatory framework of trafficking towards (post) conflict areas where the international community is represented through peacekeepers and aid workers. This chapter starts with an overview of the available knowledge of occurrence of trafficking in international presence contexts, which should be framed within a broader phenomenon of sexual abuse and exploitation of women and children in peacekeeping and aid settings.

3.1 International presence and sex trafficking: occurrence

3.1.1 Peacekeeping forces

Although alarming reports linking international peacekeeping forces to the phenomenon of sex trafficking started to emerge particularly around the turn of the century, the exact start of the occurrence of peacekeeping-related trafficking is unclear.\(^{19}\) The first peacekeeping operation, the UN Truce Supervision Organization ongoing, which has been deployed to the Middle East since 1948, did not lead to reports about sexual exploitation of women, unlike operations which started 50 years later.\(^{20}\) Presently, knowledge of the incidence of the creation and expansion of prostitution, entertainment and trafficking markets in conflict zones with the entry of international presence into such zones seems to suggest that the phenomenon is neither sporadic nor coincidental. In fact, a causal relationship seems to exist between sex trafficking in a region and the deployment of international peacekeeping forces and expatriates thereto.

\(^{19}\) For example: Lynch, 2005.

\(^{20}\) It should be noted that the phenomenon of trafficking in persons was not internationally defined until the Trafficking Protocol of 2000. The UNTSO mission was authorized by United Nations Security Council, Resolution 50 S/801, (29 May 1948) and United Nations Security Council, Resolution 73 S/1376, II, (11 August 1949).
This is supported by the emergence of prostitution and entertainment markets in regions where such markets were non-existent or only limited before the deployment of peacekeeping troops. This was the case in Cambodia, where the entry of the UN Transitional Authority in Cambodia (UNTAC) in 1992 was succeeded by an expansion of the existing prostitution market through increased numbers of prostitutes, brothels and massage parlours. A similar pattern occurred in Kosovo, where both prostitution and trafficking were “very uncommon” and “only small-scale” prior to international presence (Limanowska, 2002: 96). However, within months of their arrival, brothels emerged in the proximity of peacekeepers’ bases (Amnesty International, 2004: 7). According to the International Organization for Migration (IOM), the international presence had enabled the occurrence of trafficking and had had a “mushrooming” effect on the establishment of nightclubs in the area (AFP, 2000). By 2004, Amnesty International estimated that the local prostitution market had increased tenfold since the beginning of the 1990s and was thriving on a majority of trafficked women (Amnesty International, 2004: 5). Among those being forced into the market by criminal gangs were allegedly many under aged girls (AFP, 2000). Moreover, peacekeepers have allegedly been involved as traffickers themselves too.

Similar to the explosive increase of sex trafficking with the vicinity of the Kosovo Force (KFOR) and UNMIK missions in Kosovo since 1999 (Amnesty International, 2004: 5) in Bosnia and Herzegovina “the majority of brothels” were “in areas where there is the highest concentration of peacekeepers” (Rees, 1999: 3). The Balkan region had prior to the conflict been used as a transit area for trafficking of women into Europe, but turned into a destination with the presence of international personnel. Women were trafficked into the region from Moldova, Bulgaria and Ukraine, but also internally, forcing local women into local prostitution markets (Amnesty International, 2004: 5).

Furthermore, the UN Mission in the Democratic Republic Congo (MONUC) military observers and civilian personnel were implicated in exploitation of women in the DRC in 2004, causing considerable media attention. Similarly, the UN Transitional Administration in East Timor (UNTAET) mission in East Timor caused an increase in trafficking towards and within the region. Similarly, in East Timor a rapid increase of establishments coincided with

---

21 The number of prostitutes was reported to have risen from 6,000 to 25,000. In: MacKay, 2001.
22 This was stated by David Lamb during a congressional testimony before the U.S. House International Relations Committee on April 24, 2002.
the deployment of the UNTAET mission. Not only was the introduction of large international
presence succeeded by the emergence of a quickly expanding sex industry, but victims’
testimonies have indeed indicated that clientele consisted preponderantly of international
personnel (Caron, 2004: 15-16).

Sex trafficking towards peacekeeping zones seems to display parallels and overlap
with the age-old phenomenon of military prostitution. Historically, prostitution and
militarism have often been linked. Military missions have often been accompanied by licit
and illicit prostitution and special agreements between states on prostitution for military
personnel (Masud Ali, 2005: 148; Lee, 2005: 179-180). The ‘comfort women’ serving the
needs of Japanese military during World War I are a painful example of this. In Asia, a strong
link between the presence of (non-peacekeeping) military forces, prostitution and sex tourism
has been identified (Piper, 2005: 208). This parallel is not surprising, as military
peacekeeping personnel may serve both in fighting missions and in peacekeeping missions.

It should be noted that sex trafficking markets in peacekeeping zones do not
exclusively serve international personnel; demand from local male populations exists as well,
as is translated by the existence of two rates for sexual services: one for foreign personnel,
one for local customers. Whether international demand exceeds local demand once markets
are established, is not fully clear (Amnesty International, 2004: 47-48). However, dual rates
for categories of customers lead to greater returns from international clients; allegedly the
international presence, comprising 30 per cent of the clientele, accounted for 80 per cent of
the industry’s income in Kosovo in 2002.

3.1.2 Aid workers
In comparison to peacekeepers, information about the involvement of workers from
humanitarian and development agencies as consumers is far scarcer. In fact, no reports are
available relating specifically to sex trafficking and aid workers. Whether this means that the
involvement ratio of aid workers is lower than peacekeepers cannot be stated as for as yet, as
the matter has been researched insufficiently. Several reasons have been suggested for this

---

23 For example, in Kosovo it was estimated that in 1999 and 2000 80 per cent of customers of trafficked women
were members of the international community versus 20 per cent local customers. By the end of 2000 it was
estimated that this rate was 40 percent international (consisting of predominantly KFOR soldiers) versus 60 per
24 Based on IOM and CPWC estimates; a trafficked girl reported that KFOR soldiers paid DM100 for one hour;
local men would be charged the same amount for a night. Ibidem.
The absence of incriminating reports does not mean that aid workers’ reputation is immaculate; several reports have alleged to involvement of aid workers in cases of sexual interaction with members of host communities. This section addresses that limited available research base.

A limited number of reports have emerged concerning the sexual exploitation of women by aid workers in refugee camps – settings which are characterized by high level of violence against women in the first place. In 2002, the joint reporting of UNHCR and Save the Children UK (2002) on the involvement of humanitarian aid workers in exploitation of women in Liberia, Guinea and Sierra Leone put sexual abuse in refugee camps in an international spotlight. Women and children were reported to provide sexual services to national and international aid workers in return for food, shelter, employment and supplies on a large scale, a problem which was also reported to occur in Bhutanese refugee camps in Nepal too, where UNHCR and NGOs were implicated (Human Rights Watch, 2003: 38-39).\(^{25}\) No mention was made of the organizations’ names.

Before the release of the UNHCR/Save the Children UK report, UNHCR requested the UN Office of Internal Oversight Services (OIOS) to review the allegations of the involvement of national and international aid workers (including UN, NGO and peacekeeping staff) in the exploitation of women in West-Africa (United Nations Secretary General, 2002). Out of 43 allegations, ten cases were substantiated, eight of which involved NGO personnel. Those cases were referred to the “relevant” organizations for “appropriate follow-up” (Ibidem: para 17). The OIOS report stated that the UNHCR/Save the Children UK report had misleadingly created the impression that sexual exploitation by aid workers in West Africa was widespread “with little or no evidence”, through which it “unfairly tarnished the reputation and credibility of the large majority of aid workers, national and international staff of United Nations agencies and NGOs and United Nations peacekeepers in West Africa” (Ibidem, paras. 42 and 46).

In their 2008 report on the underreporting of sexual abuse of children by aid workers and UN peacekeepers, Save the Children UK referred to several alleged occurrences

\(^{25}\) The UNHCR “staff” were two government officials paid by UNHCR, allegedly a police officer and a government policy implementation worker; fifteen refugee men working for NGO implementing partners were the other perpetrators.
involving sexual acts between aid workers and children (Csáky, 2008). Although they constitute a minority in comparison to peacekeepers, UNHCR, World Food Programme and UN Volunteers have been alleged of involvement in sexual abuse of children (Ibidem: 8). No cases of trafficking were reported. Information concerning non-UN aid agencies seems to be harder to obtain. This problem was also encountered by Save the Children UK in their research into sexual abuse of children by aid workers, peacekeepers and other workers associated with the international community (Ibidem: 4). In that report, it was estimated that abuse of children in beneficiary populations by aid workers “is a problem for a wide range of organizations”, and a risk for every agency. Nevertheless, Save the Children UK in 2008 stated not to have been implicated in cases of abuse itself, though allegations were made against 11 staff and partners in 2006 (of which 3 were substantiated) and 15 staff and members in 2007 (of which 3 allegations against staff were substantiated) (Ibidem: 8-9).

3.1.3 Other reports of sexual misconduct and abuse

As has become apparent in the above section, sex trafficking in peacekeeping and aid contexts should be placed within the broader realm of sexual exploitation and abuse of women and children. The distinction between trafficking and other forms of sexual exploitation and abuse may be hard to make. Although not necessarily amounting to trafficking (a distinction which may be hard to make as the majority of cases do not lead to legal prosecution), reports of occurrence of sexual exploitation of local populations in peacekeeping settings have been multiple.

In many peacekeeping settings, “[p]rostitution is prevalent in the locality of missions, with women lining up near compounds in the hope they will be chosen as peacekeepers go home for the evening” (Morris, 2010: 189). Transactional sex may be a means for women and children to survive. “Often, women and children offer the only material asset they have to trade, their bodies, to these peacekeepers as a method of survival” (Martin, 2005: 1). MONUC peacekeepers in the DRC were reported to have exchanged sex with young girls for basic food items, such as milk, eggs and bread (UN Office of Internal Oversight Services, 2005: 12-15). In its 2003 Trafficking in Persons report the US State Department signalled the risk of trafficking in women emerging in Iraq; widows might be drawn to the present humanitarian personnel and peacekeepers for income in return for sex (US Department of State, 2003: 166). This phenomenon is a risk which is also applicable to aid workers working
in refugee settings, particularly in the case of dependency on humanitarian and development aid. In refugee camps where many women whose social networks have fallen apart (young girls, widows, etc.) live in poverty, the risk of transactional sex in return for foodstuffs or non-food aid exists. The report of the investigations by OIOS has laid bare the use of a “chain of exploitation”, in which other children were used to facilitate sexual abuse (Morris, 2010: 189-190). Although this amounts to sexual exploitation and abuse of position, it need not necessarily be trafficking, which requires exploitation by a third person, such as a pawn or a madam.

Apart from Cambodia, the Balkans and the DRC, reports have also emerged related to exploitation in Haiti, Côte d’Ivoire, and Sudan. The UN Mission in Ethiopia and Eritrea (UNMEE) from 2000 until 2008 was stained by reports of sexual exploitation of children by peacekeepers, leading to the expulsion of Danish, Irish, Italian and Slovakian soldiers. Jordanian, Pakistani and German military peacekeepers were alleged of involvement in trafficking in Bosnia and Herzegovina, as were civilian contractors from the US private military firm Dyncorp (Martin, 2005: 5). Over 100 Sri Lankan peacekeepers of the UN Stabilization Mission in Haiti (MINUSTAH) were sent home in 2007 after OIOS investigations into reports about their sexual abuse of local women and girls (BBC News, 2007; United Nations General Assembly; 2007: paras. 50-51). Moroccan peacekeepers of the UN Operation in Côte d’Ivoire (UNOCI) were implicated in the exploitation of women and girls (Ibidem: para. 45). OIOS substantiated abuse by UN Mission in Liberia (UNMIL) peacekeepers which was in contravention of the UNMIL Code of Conduct on Sexual Exploitation and Abuse and the Secretary General’s Bulletin (Ibidem, paras. 46-47. The investigations were met with undermining efforts from peacekeepers. African Union (AU) and other peacekeepers to the UN Mission in Sudan (UNMIS) in were accused of child sexual abuse – allegations which were denied by UNMIS but triggered OIOS investigations (Fisher, 2006; Holt & Hughes, 2007; UNMIS Public Information Office, 2007). In 2007, OIOS received 127 allegations of abuse by UN personnel; in 2008 83; 112 in 2009, and by October 2010 it had received 64 allegations (UN OIOS, 2010a). Between 2007 and October 2010, OIOS received allegations of sexual abuse involving 16 out of 22 UN missions, most of which related to military, civilian and police personnel from the MONUC, MINUSTAH, UNMIL, UNOCI and UNMIS missions (UN OIOS, 2010b). Although not necessarily
amounting to trafficking, the above does illustrate that peacekeepers and aid workers have not refrained from breaching rules of conduct related to sexual relations and abuse.

3.1.4 Accounting for differences in reports of sexual exploitation and abuse

Sexual exploitation in host communities in general suffers from levels of under-reporting which seem to be symptomatic. Although both aid workers and peacekeepers have been implicated in cases of sexual exploitation and abuse, the difference in reporting is still remarkable. There seem to be two possible approaches to this: either aid workers are nearly or at least equally involved in trafficking, but – for some reason – cases are underreported (necessitating further investigation of the reasons behind this underreporting), or aid workers are indeed involved in sexual exploitation to a lesser extent than peacekeepers, necessitating further analysis of the causes behind the tendency towards greater sexual misconduct of the latter.

Save the Children UK identified several motivations for the underreporting of child abuse which could credibly be applicable to sexual abuse of adult women. All of these point to the unequal position of beneficiary communities in comparison to aid workers: fear of stigmatization; fear of losing assistance and other negative economic impacts (for example loss of value of dowry); threat of violence; ignorance; powerlessness; lack of legal services; and a lack of confidence in the results (Csáky, 2008: 12-14). Furthermore, it may also be that civilian personnel are underreported, for example because they are less easily identifiable for lack of a uniform (Martin, 2005: 16). What is clear however is that both aid workers and peacekeepers are in a strong position of power in relation to host communities and beneficiaries of assistance. It is possible that the dependence of populations on the aid of agencies prevents reporting, for example out of fear that organizations will leave (Csáky, 2008: 12).26

The “disproportionate” representation of peacekeepers as abusers has been suggested to be caused by several reasons: Firstly, size the sheer size of peacekeeping missions exceeds the size of in comparison to aid agencies’ missions. However, Save the Children UK reported that in areas where both peacekeepers and aid workers were present, peacekeepers were still

26 A Sudanese boy who was quoted by Save the Children UK is illustrative in this sense: “People don’t report it because they are worried that the agency will stop working here, and we need them.” In: Csáky, 2008: 12.
identified as the most important and most likely “source of concern” (Csáky, 2008: 8).  

Another second possibility is their ability to exert physical power and threat through the fact that they are armed, which makes the power of peacekeepers distinct from the power of aid workers over victims (Ibidem). Thirdly, it has been suggested to be caused by the existence of discriminatory gender attitudes of a significant number of military personnel. This will be explored below (3.2.2 Acceptability and justifiability).

3.2 Applicability of the theory

3.2.1 Desirability

As stated in the previous chapter, motivations for prostitute use are multiple, but a sexual drive is inherent to all human beings. In the specific context of international missions no customer-based research is available on the motivations for prostitute use. Investigations into cases involving peacekeepers have thus far been met with denial of allegations by those imputed. As stated above, no aid workers have explicitly been linked to cases of sex trafficking.

In the UN commissioned “Zeid report” the existence of a link between peacekeepers’ little opportunities for recreation in high stress areas and their behaviour (involvement in prostitution) is suggested. Without providing substantiating proof for this suggestion, the need for “recreational facilities” and possibilities of “recuperation away from the mission area” is suggested, as well as greater flexibility in meeting family members in or outside of mission areas (Prince Zeid Ra’ad Zeid al-Hussein, 2005: paras. 50-51). While this suggests a link between a need for relaxation and blowing off steam (releasing pent-up emotions) and prostitute use, the latter also seems to suggest a link between absence from home and family and prostitute use. This link could be explained by the abstinence caused by the absence from partners at home and the lack of alternatives for sexual gratification apart from local female populations and prostitutes. The need for soldiers to blow off steam has been voiced by multiple sources and has been used as a justification for the availability of prostitution to

27 In a Save the Children UK report about sexual exploitation of children by international personnel in emergency situations, 20 out of 38 focus groups from emergency areas identified peacekeepers as the most likely perpetrators of abuse of children; four of those groups identified peacekeepers as the only source of abuse. In: Csáky, 2008: 8.
soldiers, for example by the Special Representative to Cambodia in 1993 and by the chairwoman of the Dutch Task Force Women, Security and Conflict in 2006 (Reijn; 2006). However, without empirical research into motivations, this cannot be substantiated. As was indicated above (2.1 Who constitute demand?), the use of prostitution is more common to specific categories of professions: those of persons who reside abroad for a longer term. Peacekeepers and aid workers are among the professions which entail long-term deployment abroad. However, as was also indicated, customers of prostitutes generally do not resort to prostitution as a substitute for a lack of sex, which could mean that they would not necessarily resort to prostitution. At the same time it was suggested that most men who do use prostitution have partners with whom they have sexually satisfying relationships, which could mean that they would resort to prostitution during deployment abroad. As will become apparent in the next section, in relation to male peacekeepers, the concept and perception of their masculine sexual desire may be an weighty factor for their prostitute use.

3.2.2 Acceptability and justifiability
As indicated in the previous chapter, social groups create a culture of social norms which determines the behaviour that is considered normal and acceptable, and maintain those norms through punishments entailing social consequences. Behaviour of peers functions as an important example of socially accepted behaviour. Particularly within peacekeeping operations, as social structures with their own culture, this setting and maintaining of norms is evidently relevant in driving behaviour.

Gender-based, essentialist research into social masculinities proves to be helpful in identifying and understanding the social norms applicable in peacekeeping missions. Essentialism categorizes men and women by the attribution of opposing characteristics to each: for example rationality versus emotionality, sexual activity (searching for a partner to satisfy sexual needs) versus sexual passivity (waiting to be approached), aggression versus peacefulness, etcetera (Zenck, 2010: 22 and 27). Such research into masculine culture governing behaviour in peacekeeping missions (as a subtype of a broader range of military missions) has been conducted by Enloe (2002), Higate (2003) and Whitworth (2007).

28 In a television programme Mrs. Jorritsma suggested that the Dutch peacekeeping soldiers to the NATO mission in Afghanistan (where prostitution is prohibited) should be accompanied by Dutch prostitutes, the necessity and desirability of which were denounced by the Dutch Ministry of Defence and a NATO advisor.
Peacekeeping missions, being composed overwhelmingly of male military personnel, are driven by a culture of militarized masculinity, which has even been stated to be ‘hyper-masculine’ (Martin, 2005: 5). It is characterized by a strong assertion of male heterosexuality for the determination of soldiers’ identity; strongly disassociating itself from femininity and homosexuality (Whitworth, 2007: 159-163). The identity is affirmed through heterosexual behaviour. As was shown in peacekeeping settings in the DRC and Sierra Leone, the male sex drive is widely considered to constitute and integral part of soldiers’ masculinity, a “biological fact”, which make their behaviour (including sex with local women) a justified, natural consequence (Higate, 2007: 106). A response which was heard commonly in relation to abuse by MONUC peacekeepers in the DRC is illustrative: “What do you think is going to happen when you have thousands of men away from home?” (Morris, 2005: 6).

Furthermore, as referred to above, military masculine culture is based on a belief that denial of male soldiers to engage in heterosexual activity diminishes their ability to carry out their work, though this remains unsupported by empirical evidence (Higate, 2007: footnote 24). The sex drive that is attributed to male soldiers on the basis of essentialist notions has long been used as a justification and excuse for peacekeepers’ sexual behaviour (Zenck, 2010: 27). It has been suggested that peacekeeping missions, being associated less with true masculinity than combat missions, may bring about a compensatory effect for the manliness “lost” because of the softer (non-combat) nature of the mission. “Likewise, the majority of military institutions utilize and encourage the use of prostitution and sexual release as a way of expressing manliness and maintaining high levels of soldier morale and cohesiveness.” (Enloe, 2002).

Similar research into the personalities of aid workers could shed light on the differential implication of aid workers as customers of sex trafficking. Aid agencies are increasingly including personality characteristics in their human resource management and a limited body of research on those personalities is available. As aid workers (particularly humanitarian workers) are faced with stressful situations and dire circumstances in which they may have to operate individually (without the support of a team of colleagues), aid agencies have increasingly searched for personality traits which make their employees resilient in such situations, increasing effectiveness continuity and institutional memory by diminishing risk of psychological trauma and resignation (Salama, 1999: 12; McCall & Salama, 1999: 115; Mayhew, 2002; Loquercio et al., 2006: 1).
Although no comparative research has been conducted one could assume that the culture of aid workers differs from military culture. In contrast to peacekeepers (who are basically military personnel trained for combat who perform activities which differ from the combat function of the military), the activities which aid workers perform are by nature based on “soft” principles of humanity, sympathy. Furthermore, the aid sector is not populated by male employees to the extent that the military sector is. A small study among a mixed group of male and female New Zealand overseas volunteer development workers suggests that their personalities are characterized by “openness” and “agreeableness” (Hudson & Inkson, 2007: 7). As a result, aid workers’ culture may be expected to be less masculine than the culture of peacekeepers. However, the culture in the humanitarian community may in times of emergency be a culture of bravado and competition (Salama, 1999: 12). Although limited research into aid workers’ personalities exists, such research has not included an assessment of workers’ gender attitudes; thus far they have remained limited to concerns related to staff turnover and health.

The masculine military culture accepting and justifying peacekeepers’ resort to prostitution contrasts the culture and intentions of the organizations authorizing peacekeeping missions. As a consequence, since the 1990s authorizing organizations and states have to varying extents attempted to change the culture among peacekeepers through the development of codes of conduct, regulations, investigations and enforcement measures, training and awareness-raising initiatives. These are elaborated below.

Firstly, organizations have to varying extents promulgated codes of conduct and regulations related to sexual conduct in host countries. The UN “Ten Rules: Code of Personal Conduct for Blue Helmets” were introduced in 1998 and supplemented by the UN Secretary General’s Bulletin on Special Measures for Protection from Sexual Violence and Sexual Abuse (“The Bulletin”) in 2003, containing the organization’s policy related to sexual abuse

---

29 The UN mission to Bosnia and Herzegovina (UNMBiH) consisted of only 3 per cent female workers (Rees, 1999: 3). The UN Security Council has called on the greater involvement of women in UN peacekeeping operations and incorporation of gender perspectives. However, the domain of peacekeeping is one which only loses its male character gradually. Across the board, participation of female peacekeepers has remained low, with 2.5 per cent of all 92,196 UN peacekeeping personnel being female. Female military observers are rare, as are female staff officers, though women’s participation in contingent troops and police are more common. Currently, the total percentage of female peacekeeping personnel is 3.3 per cent out of 99,926 staff (DPKO, 2010). There seems to be a slow, gradual increase in the share of women participating.
and prohibiting all sexual contact with local populations (DPKO, 1998; United Nations Secretary General, 2003). The “Statement of Commitment on Eliminating Sexual Exploitation and Abuse by UN and Non-UN Personnel” has been signed by both the UN and individual signatory states. In 2004, NATO acknowledged that trafficking undermines stabilization efforts and necessitates a “zero-tolerance policy regarding trafficking in human beings by NATO forces and staff” (North Atlantic Treaty Organization, 2004a). Although a specific code of conduct for NATO forces has not yet been formulated, the intended creation of measures to diminish demand originating from staff was expressed (North Atlantic Treaty Organization, 2004b). The OSCE in 2000 adopted a Code of Conduct for OSCE Mission obliging members to “adopt exemplary standard of personal behaviour” based on the notion that demand exacerbates the problem of trafficking (Organization for Security and Co-operation in Europe, 2000: para. 6). The African Union has no such code, and in fact many of its member states have been ranked high on the US Trafficking in Persons ranking, indicating that they address trafficking insufficiently.

Humanitarian aid agencies, united with UN agencies in the Inter-Agency Standing Committee, have developed a 6-principled code of conduct which aims at the elimination of sexual abuse by humanitarian workers (Inter-Agency Standing Committee Task Force, 2002: 1). These principles and others were included in a code of conduct developed individually by UNHCR (UNHCR, 2003a; Ibidem, 2003b). The renewed statement of commitment to the elimination of sexual exploitation was endorsed by 22 UN entities and 24 international NGOs in 2006 (DPKO et al., 2006).

Apart from the promulgation of codes and regulations, statements acknowledging the need seriousness of the problem have been made. In 2000, the UN Secretary General in his report pursuant to UN Security Council resolution 1325 in a special section devoted to violence against women and trafficking briefly referred to the issue of compliance of personnel to anti-trafficking regulations promulgated by UNMIK in Kosovo, as well as consequences of non-compliance (United Nations Secretary General, 2000: paras. 278-286). In general, the Secretary General called for stronger codes of conduct to prevent peacekeeping-induced trafficking and greater accountability measures, preventing impunity (Ibidem: paras. 89-90). This was linked to peacekeeping operations, though not to humanitarian operations.
In response to allegations of involvement in trafficking and other forms of sexual abuse and exploitation, organizations have to a limited extent initiated investigations. OIOS in 2005 presented its research into 72 allegations of involvement of MONUC military observers and civilian staff in sexual abuse and exploitation of women in the DRC. In 2004, the UN Secretary General requested the Permanent Representative of Jordan, Prince Zeid Ra’ad Zeid al-Hussein, being a former civilian peacekeeper and the representative of a troop contributing country, to draw up a report of the problem of sexual exploitation by peacekeepers and to present advisory solutions (Prince Zeid Ra’ad Zeid al-Hussein, 2005). The “Zeid Report” was the first general assessment of the occurrence of sexual exploitation and abuse by UN peacekeepers and contained “a comprehensive strategy to eliminate future sexual exploitation and abuse in United Nations peacekeeping missions”, which includes the deployment of discipline officer s (United Nations Security Council, 2004).

However, despite the issuing of condemning responses to reports and allegations of trafficking and other forms of sexual exploitation and abuse, and investigations into trafficking allegations, a “boys will be boys” attitude towards peacekeeping-associated gender-based violence has continued to resonate ever since allegations emerged (Withworth, 2004: 71).  

For regulations and codes of conduct to be adhered to and to be respected, they should be shared, understood and internalized by those whom they apply to. As was indicated in the previous chapter (2.4.1 Acceptability and justifiability), what is considered justified to a large extent depends on behaviour of peers and what people can get away with (Anderson & O’Connell Davidson, 2003: 42). Thus far, measures taken have generally not constituted a risk, inasmuch that persons can still get away with their behaviour. For the breaking of local laws, codes of conducts and regulations to constitute a risk, it is essential that they are enforced, with adequate disciplinary, financial and criminal accountability in case of breach.

Enforcement of applicable laws and codes of conduct has proven ineffective as peacekeepers are “subject to a host of different legal, jurisdictional and contractual regimes that make a single solution to the problem of peacekeeper sexual abuse elusive” (Allred, 30

30 The Special Representative to the Secretary General to Cambodia in response to allegations of sexual misconduct and drunkenness of UNTAC personnel was reported by attendant NGOs at a meeting to have deemed the behaviour natural for young soldiers returning from the field to want to drink beer and chase local women and girls. The condoning attitude of “boys will be boys” cause widespread criticism from.
Although forces are held to respect local laws, host states often do not have the capacity or authority to try offenders in case of breach of those laws (DPKO, 1998: para. 2). Furthermore, peacekeepers are often wrapped in “various layers of immunity that protects [sic] them from prosecution by local authorities in any event” (Allred, 2009: 318).

The UN Charter and the Convention on the Privileges and Immunities of the United Nations ensure functional immunity for UN personnel, allowing the UN to carry out its functions independently. Furthermore, agreements between troop contributing states and the UN on the terms of their participation ensure considerable, by varying levels of immunity from prosecution, ensuring that discipline is executed only by the respective member state. Although it has been impossible to maintain immunity entirely, enforcement and prosecution have remained limited. The responsibility of ensuring accountability in case of involvement of military personnel in activities prohibited by local or international law in the host state depends on the SOFA (Status of Forces) or SOMA (Status of Mission) agreements made between the troop-contributing state and the authorizing international organization. Civilian personnel in principle also enjoy immunity from prosecution, and the ensuring of accountability depends on the sending state (Morris, 2010: 198-199).

Over the years, the immunity of personnel has come under increasing pressure. The Secretary General has the unique “right and the duty to waive the immunity of any official in any case where, in his opinion, the immunity would impede the course of justice and can be waived without prejudice to the interests of the United Nations” (United Nations, 1946: para. 20). Member states can waive immunity of their nationals for the same reason (Ibidem: para. 14). Although authorizing organizations and troop-contributing states have the authority to take measures and to prosecute offenders, the gravity of punishment has commonly not exceeded repatriation to the home country (Allred, 2009: 318).

Although codes of conduct and policies and discipline methods may exist, this is no guarantee that the reasoning behind them is understood by personnel. The ultimate goal of

31 “Officials are “immune from legal process in respect of words spoken or written and all acts performed by them in their official capacity” (sect. 18 (a)), and experts on mission enjoy “immunity from personal arrest or detention …” and “in respect of words spoken or written and acts done by them in the course of the performance of their mission, immunity from legal process of every kind” (sect. 22 (a) and (b)). Senior officials at the rank of Assistant Secretary-General and above enjoy the same privileges and immunities as those accorded to diplomatic envoys (sect. 19), including immunity from criminal jurisdiction as provided in respect of diplomatic envoys under the Vienna Convention on Diplomatic Relations, of 1961.” United Nations, 1946: para. 58.
preventative measures should hence be “to produce soldiers who internalize the inherent depravity of rape and sexual slavery and who make decisions based on this knowledge” (Reynolds, 1998: 612). To the individual, the resort to prostitution may be a form of relaxation, without the potential repercussions for the missions being understood. This is why peacekeepers are increasingly being informed as a way to diminish and prevent prostitute use (and thus creation of demand for sex trafficking). However, greater sensitization, training and capacity is being called for, as some “campaigns” are nothing more than the printing of posters and dissemination of those during missions (Wölte, 2004: 8).

The intention to promulgate training programmes and awareness campaigns has been expressed by multiple organizations. NATO agreed to initiate “appropriate training” for personnel (NATO, 2004) and the UN Security Council requested the provision of “training guidelines and materials on the protection, rights and the particular needs of women (…), invites Member States to incorporate these elements (…) into their national training programmes for military and civilian police personnel in preparation for deployment, and further requests the Secretary-General to ensure that civilian personnel of peacekeeping operations receive similar training”, though no explicit reference to trafficking was made (United Nations Security Council, 2000). According to the UN, “training on preventing sexual exploitation and abuse has been mandatory for all personnel on arrival in a UN peacekeeping mission” since 2005 (UN Conduct and Discipline Unit32, 2010b). The UN Conduct and Discipline Unit (CDU) is tasked with formulating policies with regards to conduct and discipline in field missions, as well as formulating and overseeing training and outreach activities and the handling of allegations of misconduct by maintaining a misconduct tracking system (United Nations Conduct and Discipline Unit, 2010a). Although “mandatory” prior to deployment according to the UN, responsibility for training and awareness-raising on human rights and anti-trafficking is to the discretion of troop-sending states (Wölte, 2004: 35). UN Conduct and Discipline Teams conduct “mission-based awareness-raising campaigns.” Peacekeeping missions in Sudan (UNMIS), Liberia (UNMIL), Haiti (MINUSTAH), Democratic Republic of Congo (MONUC), Timor-Leste (UNMIT) and Côte d’Ivoire (UNOCI) conducted campaigns during 2008-2009 to combat prostitution/transactional sex involving UN personnel.

---

32 Originally named Conduct and Discipline Team (CDT).
As yet, no comprehensive evaluation of the effectiveness of awareness and sensitization efforts has been conducted, which means that it is not yet possible to conclude on the relevance of knowledge concerning trafficking on the demand for sex trafficking. Thus far, no consultative studies have been conducted among peacekeepers and aid workers who were involved in buying services of trafficked women in host states. Such empirical, customer-based knowledge would be of great value to preventative measures, potentially revealing attitudes towards women, prostitution and sex trafficking and offering entry points for intervention strategies targeting such attitudes. Unfortunately, all peacekeepers who have allegedly engaged in such acts, have thus far denied charges; the involvement of aid workers is insufficiently documented; hence, no conclusions can be drawn on how ‘confirmed’ customers justified their consumption of sex services from trafficked women.

From a justice perspective, in the limited cases of enforcement and prosecution of breaches of codes of conduct and laws of the host state, the weight of punishments has been far below satisfactory level considering the gravity of offences (rape, sexual abuse and exploitation, abuse of power, and even trafficking in persons). For example, three US and one UNMIK personnel in Kosovo were found to have breached the code of conduct through the assistance of traffickers and involvement in the trafficking process. Two of them were punished through repatriation; the other two received “letters of reprimand” (Amnesty International, 2004: 49). Unlike states, the UN are not a subject of international law; they are even protected by immunity through the 1946 Convention on the Privileges and Immunities of the United Nations. As a consequence, the burden of penalization of perpetrators rests on the contributing states, which have thus far generally been reluctant to instigate prosecution. Even in the case of breaches of local laws by private contractors, which host states would have jurisdiction to prosecute, prosecution has been rare (Prince Zeid Ra’ad Zeid al-Hussein, 2005).

The unwillingness of troop-contributing states to instigate investigations and prosecution may be explained by considerations related to reputation, although reputation may be the very reason why prosecution would be beneficial. The UN General Assembly in 2008 adopted a resolution aimed at diminishing impunity of offenders through the extension of jurisdiction to criminal misconduct. Legal possibilities and opportunities for greater cooperation on the matter of prosecution of nationals have been identified (United Nations General Assembly, 2008).
3.2.3 Accessibility

In the previous chapter, accessibility was determined to refer to the physical and material ability to realize a desire. Workers should thus have money, or alternatively goods, favours or protection to offer in return for sex services, but they should also have physical access to commercial sex.

In comparison to local populations, aid workers and peacekeepers earn a considerable wage which they partly spend locally to meet their needs. Many agencies and states pay their employees additional *per diem* allowances for their stay abroad (Zenck, 2010: 3). As such, they are important inputs into the local economy. As indicated above, the means available to aid workers and peacekeepers in order to afford commercial sex need not be high, yet the occurrence of differential price-setting by exploiters (traffickers, suppliers) of trafficked women suggests greater affordability of prostitution to foreign workers. As trafficking is a business which requires relatively little investment, prices of sexual services need not be high. Because of the nature of their work, apart from financial means, aid workers and peacekeepers dispose of other tradable goods and ‘services’, such as food and non-food items, favours and protection (including protection for traffickers’ businesses and establishments, etc.).

In order to diminish soldiers’ physical access to prostitution, both the UN and NATO have established curfews and “off limits lists” of establishments which staff are not allowed to visit. Furthermore, the UN have introduced restrictions to movement as well as curfews, and the requirement for soldiers to wear uniforms while off duty and non-fraternization policies (proscribing the interaction of forces with communities and other forces) (United Nations Conduct and Discipline Unit, 2010b). However, peacekeeping staff and traffickers have been shown to respond flexibly to such measures by the relocation of forced prostitutes to new establishments or by moving women into military bases and other buildings, a practice which was identified in the Balkans. On the other hand, the effectiveness of such a restrictive regime limiting accessibility of certain establishments may be effective, as was demonstrated in the same region: US military peacekeeping troops under NATO command were under stricter restrictions than peacekeepers of other nationalities. This was linked to

---

33 For example, German soldiers receive €150 per diem on top of their monthly salary.
the observation that peacekeepers from other nationalities were implicated in the worst offences against trafficked women (Hughes, 2004: 56). In Afghanistan, NATO International Security Assistance Force (ISAF) troops operating under UN authority were obliged to spend their leisure time on their military bases in order to prevent involvement in the exploitation of local women. Whether this was effective, is not yet known (Wölte, 2004: 35).

The “Zeid Report” relating to engagement in sexual activities by peacekeepers suggests several measures which should limit or prevent peacekeepers’ access to prostitution, such as the requirement to wear uniforms while off duty, the enforcement of strict entry controls, the instalment of curfews, designation of off-limits areas, the confinement of soldiers to barracks while off duty, and mobile (instead of static) area patrols to prevent women from entering military bases (Prince Zeid Ra’ad Zeid al-Hussein, 2005: para. 47). As may be clear, the effectiveness is dependent on enforcement through the introduction of penalties. Furthermore, the Zeid report proposes extraordinary prohibition of all sexual relations in high-risk areas, a measure which would be stricter than those in The Bulletin.34

Conclusion

Since the 1990s, reports about the involvement of peacekeepers, and to a lesser extent aid workers, in sexual exploitation and abuse have emerged. Peacekeepers have been identified as consumers of the sexual services of trafficked women, though no reports explicitly identifying aid workers as consumers have emerged. Lack of willingness to investigate and prosecute has caused the identification of the specific occurrences of trafficking to remain limited. Nevertheless, it is clear that neither group refrains from sexual relations with women and children in host countries. The influence of demand for sexual services from peacekeepers on trafficking towards conflict zones has increasingly been acknowledged by relevant organizations. It has increasingly been acknowledged that peacekeeping-induced trafficking institutionalises gender inequality, injustice and the undermining of the rule of law. Nevertheless, while acknowledged, inclinations to address demand seem to be absent.

When the elements determining demand (desirability, acceptability/justifiability and accessibility) are applied to the specific case of international presence in conflict areas, one

---

34 The Bulletin does not prohibit relationships between staff and members of the local population; it only discourages them.
of the elements proves to be of paramount relevance in the case of peacekeepers: justifiability and acceptability of the demand for prostitution and sex trafficking, which originates from group culture. Although a biological desire may exist, without such justification and acceptance (derived through social acceptance) of the legitimacy of the fulfilment of that desire through resort to prostitution it is less likely to be realized. Although accessibility may be diminished in several manners, both the demand and supply sides sex trafficking by nature seek to circumvent such barriers if risks allow it. As a result of a lack of information on aid workers, no such conclusions can be drawn on this group of international personnel.

Demand-related preventative measures employed highlight the relevance of risk of enforcement as a sign of unacceptability for changing behaviour. The lack of a credible, calculable risk allows culture and hence behaviour to go unchecked. However, although risks may change behaviour, they may not change attitudes towards women, prostitution and sex trafficking. Codes of conduct, regulations and enforcement should be supported by training and awareness-raising to heighten understanding of the reasoning behind those norms, as internalization of non-accepting attitude towards sex trafficking is the ultimate prevention. Ideally, such attitudes are taught before or from the moment of entry into the military.
Conclusion

This study aims to provide an explanatory framework for emergence and growth of sex trafficking markets in conflict where international personnel from peacekeeping missions and aid organizations are present. Application of a market perspective to this trade in human lives aids to strip the phenomenon down to its essence: an interaction between consumers and suppliers, whose behaviour is influenced by external factors which diminish or promote their possibilities to interact. Because of the responsive nature of supply to demand (on the condition that there is a possibility for suppliers to raise profits), demand can be considered the main driver of sex trafficking which necessitates further analysis. It can be broken down into three elementary principles: desirability (based on biological desire), acceptability and justifiability in social contexts and accessibility in terms of affordability and physical access.

Reports related to sexual exploitation and abuse of host populations (involving women and children) have emerged since the 1990s both with respect to peacekeeping and aid personnel, but the phenomenon is likely to be seriously underreported as a result of the subordinate position of host communities and the stigma surrounding the issue. Despite general underreporting, peacekeepers have been alleged of involvement to a greater extent than aid workers. Furthermore, while peacekeepers have been linked specifically to sex trafficking as customers of forced prostitutes (thus creating demand for sex trafficking), aid workers have not. Their alleged involvement in other forms of exploitation and abuse is also less extensive compared to the alleged involvement of peacekeepers.

The analysis of the elements of desirability, acceptability/justifiability and accessibility particularly in the context of peacekeeping forces reveals that peacekeeping forces, as fairly passive military forces, have a culture of masculinity. This militarized masculinity strengthens essentialist gender notions, leading to a perception of exaggerated male biological sexual desire, the pursuit of which is justified on the basis of perceived biological traits and accepted by existing social norms. As such, the pursuit of biological desire is considered a legitimate affirmation of identity.

Although this culture does not correspond with the culture which peacekeeping organizations desire their subordinates to adhere to, organizations and troop contributing states have thus far been unable to challenge the phenomenon completely. They have to
varying extents increased enforcement of regulations and diminished access to prostitution and trafficking. However, as there is a tendency towards evasion of regulations if the opportunity presents itself, changes in behaviour are most effective if backed by attitudes instead of a calculation of risk. Their lack of ability and willingness to introduce preventative measures has continued to ensure a level of low-risk accessibility which allows peacekeepers to purchase commercial sex from forced prostitutes.

In order to change the acceptability of sex trafficking altogether, a change of social norms should be effected. If such a cultural change is reached, the impetus to resort to prostitution, knowing that there is a likelihood that women are being forced to prostitute themselves, may be removed. To change cultural norms however necessitates more than the introduction of risk through measures of enforcement; it requires education and internalization of and adherence to new principles which cause employees to refrain from buying sex services from trafficking victims.

This study has been unable to account for the differential reported involvement of aid workers as consumers of sexual services from trafficked women and other exploitation and abuse. Research into personality characteristics of aid workers could provide a definitive answer to whether aid workers’ culture differs significantly from military culture. Further research into male peacekeepers’ and aid workers’ gender attitudes could contribute to sensitization and education programmes targeting demand by providing greater detail of the precise attitudes which are likely to correlate with non-condemnation of sex trafficking.

What should be borne in mind however, is that the phenomena of sex trafficking and prostitution by nature are largely obscured and surrounded by stigma and manipulative thinking processes, diminishing possibilities for objective conclusions related to consumer attitudes and behaviour. Similarly, any study involving the supply (victim) side of the phenomenon, should take into account prejudice, stigma and fear.

Demand related research is a fairly novel strand of trafficking research, the necessity of which is increasingly being acknowledged. Interestingly, the relevance of consumer demand in comparison to the causes and facilitating factors of victimization and supply seems to be acknowledged in contexts of peacekeeping-induced sex trafficking more than in
general trafficking research. While often studied within existing, “static” populations in existing prostitution and trafficking markets, the “transplantation” of a large, predominantly male, population however serves to display how demand generates and expands markets where they were previously non-existent or only modest. Driven by considerable opportunities for profit and facilitated by insufficient deterrent conditions, traffickers supply women for the trade in response to demand. Although the approach needs further development, application of a demand-related perspective has the potential to target the ultimate cause of the phenomenon. Through its addition to existing prevention methods targeting supply and market conditions, the development of comprehensive, holistic trafficking prevention strategies will at last be possible.
Bibliography


Hughes, Donna M. “Best practices to address the demand side of sex trafficking.” University of Rhode Island. (2004). Web.


